The Role of Activists in the News Coverage of the Case of Philando Castile

A Thesis
SUBMITTED TO THE FACULTY OF THE
UNIVERSITY OF MINNESOTA
BY

Meghan Erkkinen

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE DEGREE OF
MASTER OF ARTS

Advisor: Amy O'Connor

August 2017

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to acknowledge the numerous people who aided in the completion of this thesis project. First, I would like to thank my advisor, Amy O'Connor, who reviewed countless drafts and provided invaluable feedback throughout the process. Professor O'Connor helped add depth, clarity, and valuable insights throughout, and I cannot thank her enough for her patience and thorough reviews of my work.

I also greatly appreciate the contributions of my committee members, Valerie Belair-Gagnon and Joanne Miller, who took time to provide feedback and suggestions to strengthen my research. Professor Belair-Gagnon also provided resources on journalism research that intrigued and inspired me to continue pursuing questions about the impact of digital technologies on news. I am grateful to Sid Bedingfield, who provided help finding relevant political communication literature and theories to support this research. I would also like to thank Seth Lewis, who aided me in developing a solid agenda-building methodology for a previous paper that I then adapted for this thesis. Magdalene Lee, my research partner for that earlier paper, was the person with whom I discovered the agenda-building literature. Our partnership on the paper in explicating and discussing the theory of agenda building helped me formulate the concept for this project.

I would also like to thank Spiro Kiousis of the University of Florida, who has conducted several studies on agenda building, provided his codebook for my previous work. I used his codebook as the basis of my framing coding protocol for this study.

Finally, I would like to acknowledge the patience and feedback of Ben Miller, who helped me edit and revise the final drafts of this thesis.

ABSTRACT

This paper examines the role of activists and social media in the news coverage of the controversial death of Philando Castile at the hands of police. Using the agenda-building framework, this paper found that no relationship existed between news coverage and the tweets of Black Lives Matter activists. The results of this paper suggest that journalists continue to use elite and official sources in constructing news narratives. This paper also supports previous research that suggests that journalists use social media in their news reporting, signaling a change in norms and routines. The implications of these findings for journalism, news consumers, and activist movements are discussed.

Table of Contents

List of Tables

INTRODUCTION

On the evening of July 6, 2016, a 32-year-old African-American man named Philando Castile was shot and killed by a police officer in the St. Paul, Minnesota, suburb of Falcon Heights. In a twist made possible due to 21st century technology, Castile's girlfriend, Diamond Reynolds, captured the immediate aftermath of the shooting via Facebook Live. The livestream of a moaning Castile, whose white shirt was stained red with blood while his girlfriend calmly narrated the shooting back to the panicked officer, quickly circulated the internet (Furber and Pérez-Peña, 2016). Within hours, activists both in the Twin Cities and elsewhere in the United States began tweeting first with the hashtag #FalconHeightsShooting and, after Castile's name was made public, with #PhilandoCastile. The case was compared to another, the death of Alton Sterling in Baton Rouge, just the day before. Twitter users, including many Black Lives Matter activists, commented on the case, making charges of racial profiling and bias. Users also wondered whether Castile, who had a gun he was legally allowed to carry, would have been shot if he had been white.

The news media also picked up on the story, and public officials issued press statements calling for investigations into the matter. Castile's case was one of many others that drew the attention of Black Lives Matter activists across the country who were calling for increased accountability and police reform ("Black Lives Matter," 2016). Journalists reporting on the issue had numerous sources to turn to, including the official police account, Reynolds' video, press statements from public officials, and the activists

and social media users commenting online. Where did journalists turn in collecting information and comments on Castile's death and the protests that followed?

This paper sets out to answer this question by examining the sources used in news coverage of the event. In addition to cataloguing the sources quoted or referenced, this paper will also use the theory of agenda building to test whether a relationship exists between news coverage of Castile's death and the statements of activists, or whether news coverage primarily mirrors the statements of politicians and other political elites.

In the nearly 50 years since it was first published, the agenda-setting theory posited by McCombs and Shaw (1972) has been tested, expounded upon, and critiqued more than 400 times (McCombs & Reynolds, 2009). Among the extensions of agenda-setting theory is agenda building. Whereas agenda setting addresses the question of whether the media influences the public's agenda, agenda building seeks to discover who and what influences the media's agenda. Understanding this key link in the information chain is essential to recognizing how actors in a democracy shape the public agenda.

One of the central questions for modern democracies is how to provide all citizens access to the democratic process (Young, 2002). In tackling this challenge, Cobb and Elder (1971) note that systemic forces disadvantage some citizens while advantaging others. Those who are marginalized within the system can find it difficult to move their most pressing issues onto the public agenda because they don't have the same influence on politicians, public officials, or the news media. Communication research has shown that the media's agenda is overwhelmingly influenced by traditional and elite actors such

as prominent politicians and well-funded interest groups (Gilberg, Eyal, McCombs, and Nicholas, 1980; Gilens and Page, 2014).

The rise of social media may change centuries-old political and social dynamics, however. With little effort, internet users have the potential to reach mass audiences through social networking platforms like the microblogging site Twitter and the video-sharing site YouTube. Journalists have also made use of social media, both to report on stories and to engage with the public (Lariscy, Avery, Sweetser, & Howes, 2009; Belair-Gagnon, Mishra, & Agur, 2014). In particular, reporters also frequently turn to Twitter in their news gathering to find witnesses and take accounts of events (Kreiss, 2014; Parmelee, 2013; Broersma & Graham, 2013). Twitter allows users to post instant available messages of 140 characters or less to their list of followers, which can number into the millions. The platform's default is that messages are public, meaning that anyone, even those who are not following someone, can view their posts. Through this platform, journalists can collect immediate information from a variety of sources from their computers (Parmelee, 2013). In their reporting, many journalists also make use of tools such as SocialMention and Topsy to track popular conversation topics and key influencers online (Holt, 2014).

At the same time, Twitter has become a popular tool for activists to engage participants and provide immediate information to interested parties (Veenstra, Iyer, Hossain, & Park, 2013). Many of these activists and movements have large followings online, yet there exists little evidence that activists and minority voices are able to have a significant impact on the media's agenda (Weaver and Choi, 2014). Further study on this

subject, as Weaver and Choi (2014) urge, will help illuminate the extent to which these minority voices, through social media, now have an influence on traditional media outlets. This, in turn, will help scholars better understand the evolution of democracy with the advent of digital technologies.

The Black Lives Matter movement is an exemplar for considering the function of Twitter in agenda building for four reasons. First, the movement has received significant media attention, thereby providing a wealth of source material to examine. Second, leading activists have been featured in televised interviews and had their tweets published or referenced in print. This suggests that the media is willing to use activists as sources in the coverage of the movement. Third, Black Lives Matter engages and organizes primarily through the use of the Twitter campaign #BlackLivesMatter (and related hashtags), and much of the information journalists get on the movement comes from Twitter (Day, 2015). The use of a hashtag on Twitter and other social media platforms indicates a topic of conversation, which anyone can join by employing the hashtag (#) followed by a word or phrase denoting the topic. Hashtags also make it easy for Twitter users, including journalists, to search for a read through a conversation taking place on the platform (Parmelee, 2013). While some research indicates that journalists generally still rely heavily on more traditional agenda-builders, such as public relations efforts (from police departments, for example) and politicians (Weaver & Choi, 2014), the widespread coverage of Black Lives Matter, its heavy online presence, and journalists' increasing use of Twitter as a source, suggests this movement may share a significant agenda-building relationship with the news media.

The agenda-building ability of the Black Lives Matter movement is interwoven with its focus on the killing of minorities by police officers and several high-profile cases. The primary focus of the Black Lives Matter movement is to address the killing of minorities, and in particular African Americans, by police officers. One such case that generated immediate, nationwide attention was the death of Philando Castile. Castile's case came during a period of increased attention to the issues raised by Black Lives Matter because it immediately followed the shooting of another black man, Alton Sterling, by police officers in Baton Rouge, Louisiana. The deaths of Castile and Sterling led to more than 100 protests in 88 cities in the two weeks that followed (Lee, Mykhyalyshyn, Omri, & Singhvi, 2016). Castile's case presents an opportunity to examine the impact of not only national Black Lives Matter activists, but also local Minnesota activists, who have an established presence in the Twin Cities area, having previously organized protests after the death of another black man, Jamar Clark, in November 2015 (Holpuch, 2015). Local activists may play a role in agenda building, particularly at local media outlets, which may cover nearby demonstrations more thoroughly than the national media. Castile's case, then, presents an opportunity to examine agenda building in both local and national media markets.

The overarching goal of this paper is to examine whether and how reporters use Black Lives Matter activists' online discussions to inform their coverage of police-involved deaths of black individuals. Doing so answers calls by scholars to investigate the role of social media in newsgathering (Kreiss, 2014; Parmelee, 2013; Broersma and Graham, 2013). It will also help address the question of whether activists and other

political minorities impact the media's coverage of issues that matter to them (Weaver and Choi, 2014). This paper will not address whether activists *cause* changes in news coverage. It will, however, address whether the news reports on the same issues that activists discuss online and whether journalists use activists as sources in their coverage of police-involved shootings.

This paper will contribute to existing literature in three ways. First, this paper will provide a detailed overview of the issues discussed and frames used by political elites, activists, and the media in relation to cases of police brutality. Second, it will examine which sources the media turn to in reporting on such cases. Previous literature suggests that media tend to rely on official and elite sources in their reporting (Bennett, 1990; Hänggli, 2012; Gilens and Page, 2014), but as journalists turn to social media in their newsgathering, they may also encounter previously underrepresented opinions. This paper seeks to determine whether those underrepresented individuals find a voice in news articles. Finally, this paper will add to existing research on first- and second-level agenda building. By examining both the issues discussed and the frames used by activists and in news articles, I will test whether correlations exist.

In answering my research questions, I hope to fill an important gap in the literature on agenda-building and news sourcing. By understanding how agenda building and newsgathering may be changing in the era of social media, researchers can better understand how and where journalists get information, which new actors may influence media coverage, and how new technologies may be impacting the public agenda regarding race-related policies and issues.

LITERATURE REVIEW

In reviewing the relevant literature, I will examine the early research on agenda setting and how agenda building evolved from the original agenda-setting research; describe the current state of agenda building research, particularly with the advent of digital media and mobile communication; and review the research related to activists' roles in setting the media agenda. In addition, to better understand activism in a digital media environment, I will examine how and why activists are using social media. Finally, I will examine the specific case for my research by describing the Black Lives Matter movement, including its origins and how it uses social media. I will then lay out the case of Philando Castile.

Setting and Building the Media Agenda

The conceptual roots of agenda building came about not specifically in relation to the media, but in relation to politics. Cobb and Elder, in their 1971 article on political agenda building, focused their attention on political participation and legislative agenda building. Tangentially, they gave some consideration to the news media's role in shaping the political agenda. The authors alluded to the power of the media in pushing issues onto the legislative agenda by arguing that to "reach the formal agenda, an issue should evoke a response on a mass level," which can most easily be done through mass communication (p. 161). This paper focuses on the concept of media agenda building and asks one basic question: who, or what, build the media agenda?

To understand agenda building, one must first understand its intellectual roots. First proposed by McCombs and Shaw in their groundbreaking 1972 study, agenda-setting theory maintains that the news media sets the public agenda. In other words, the decisions that the news media make in their reporting affect the public's perception of what issues are important. The authors tested their hypothesis during the 1968 presidential elections and found that the issues that were most salient in news reports became the most salient issues in the minds of the public (McCombs & Shaw, 1972). They concluded, based on their findings, that the media "appear to have exerted a considerable impact on voters' judgments of what they consider the major issues of the campaign" (McCombs & Shaw, 1972, p. 180). Agenda-setting theory, the authors explain, is about the transfer of an issue's salience from one agenda (the media's) to another (the public's).

In the decades since it was introduced, agenda-setting theory has become one of the most tested theories in mass communication research (McCombs & Reynolds, 2009). In the early 1980s, scholars began to address another level of the agenda-setting phenomenon: agenda building (McCombs, 2014). Agenda building is defined as the transfer of issue salience from communicators (such as elites or activists) to the mass media (Denham, 2010). While research indicated that the media set the public's perception of issue salience (McCombs, 2014), researchers sought to determine who or what was setting the media's agenda. Although the question was new in the context of agenda setting, scholars had been working for several decades to determine how journalists decided which news to cover. As early as the 1950s, researchers suggested

that newsroom policies, norms, and practices tended to result in news that supported existing societal power dynamics (Breed, 1955). To this point, Tuchman's (1978) research suggested that by relying on official sources to construct their news narratives, journalists upheld, rather than challenged, the status quo and established institutions. News reports tended to focus on specific "actors," who included the president and other elected officials, as well as criminals, deviants, and protesters (Gans, 1979).

More recent research suggests that journalists and editors are governed by myriad influences when they are deciding on what stories to cover. As Shoemaker and Reese note in their 1996 book "Mediating the Message," journalists are constrained by influences at all levels of society, from individual influences to the limitations of media institutions, social institutions, and even social systems. Within this hierarchy of influences, various agendas compete for attention in the public sphere. These agendas include those of political campaigns, legislative bodies, public relations teams, and activists (Weaver and Choi, 2014). In addition, influential individuals – most notably in the United States, the president – may play a more significant role in setting the media and public agenda (Wanta, Stephenson, Turk, and McCombs, 1989).

The earliest agenda-building literature sought to contribute to the conversation on who, or what, influenced coverage choices by examining the transfer of issue salience between political actors and media coverage. Some of the first agenda-building studies focused on presidential State of the Union addresses and whether they appeared to have an influence on subsequent press coverage. The findings of these studies were mixed. Notably, some even showed an agenda-building relationship in the opposite direction,

from the press to the president thus the more traditional agenda setting process. These findings led researchers to conclude that other influences may be at play in building the media's agenda (Gilberg et al., 1980; Wanta et al., 1989).

From this research, scholars began to examine which other actors may be influencing media coverage. Many turned their focus toward strategic communicators, including public relations professionals and lobbyists, and their attempts to influence the political and public agenda through the media. One researcher outlined the ways in which policy advocates could use the media to influence the political agenda (Nelson, 1986). By using the media to influence the public's perceptions of the salience of child abuse legislation, Nelson argued that child advocates could then gain political support for laws targeting the mistreatment of children (1986). Meanwhile, other studies demonstrated the role of the media in setting the legislative agenda. For example, one study of a Texas daily newspaper found correlations between the paper's editorials and later legislative agenda items (Brewer & McCombs, 1996).

This foundational agenda-building research focused on the influence of elites in building the news agenda. Elites, as defined by Kleemans et al. (2015), are "representatives of government agencies, politicians, media, or journalists as sources; experts; law enforcement; and emergency services" (p. 471). For this paper, elites also include public organizations, such as nonprofits and religious organizations, which Kleemans et al. define as "civil society sources."

A large body of literature has suggested that these elite individuals and groups are, in fact, the ones who shape the media narrative (Bennett, 1990; Goldsteen,

Goldsteen, Swan, & Clementa, 2001). According to Bennett (1990), news coverage tends to mirror the consensus and disagreement of elites. Any conversation falling outside the realm of this discourse are typically marginalized by the mainstream press and receives less attention. An examination of health care policy coverage, for example, found that it was elites who shaped press coverage of the conversation (Goldsteen et al., 2001). The U.S. president, who may be considered among the most prominent elites in the United States, has been shown to have a significant impact on which domestic issues the media covers (Edwards & Wood, 1999). Taken as a whole, this body of research on who influences media coverage suggests that it is elites who ultimately shape legislation. Therefore, activists operating outside the traditional political sphere would find little success pushing their concerns onto the media, and consequently, the political and legislative agendas.

In contrast to elites, agents are "citizens or groups of citizens who are committed to do things or get things done" (Kleemans et al., 2015, p. 472). Agents do not hold official or formal roles in civic organizations or government, but they nonetheless seek to effect change within the political system. The term agent mirrors the colloquial understanding of activist. To be consistent with what the sources that are included in this study call themselves, the remainder of the document will use the term activist. For the purpose of the case that will be examined in this paper, these activists most often align themselves with the Black Lives Matter movement, either by declaring themselves as affiliated or by attending a demonstration organized by the movement. A central question of this paper is whether these activists may be playing a role in building the media's

agenda, or whether their perspectives continue to be sidelined by elite actors (e.g., Bennett, 1990; Gilens & Page, 2014).

First- and Second-Level Agenda Building

In addition to the role sources have in agenda building, agenda-building research also examines the relationship between information subsidies and media coverage. According to Gandy, an information subsidy is material that is "made available at something less than the cost a user would face in the absence of the subsidy" (1982, p. 61). Information subsidies are "efforts of news sources to intentionally shape the news agenda by reducing journalists' costs of gathering information" (Berkowitz and Adams, 1990, p. 723). Subsidies include public relations and campaign communications such as press releases, media kits, videos, reports, speeches, and, more recently, internet-based communications (Kiousis et al., 2009; Parmelee, 2013).

Researchers often break down the agenda-building relationship into various levels. First-level agenda-building addresses the transfer of issue salience from information subsidies to the news media (McCombs, 2014). Salience is "making a piece of information more noticeable, meaningful, or memorable to audiences" (Entman, 1993, p. 53). These issues, often called *attitude objects*, may be political concerns like the environment or foreign policy, or they may be political parties, individuals, or any other topics that might be the subject of a news report. For this paper, issues may refer to policy or social concerns related to police violence and, more generally, race-related issues, as well as to public figures. First-level agenda-building research, therefore, seeks

to understand whether the issues present in information subsidies are also present in news reports. Evidence for a first-level agenda-building relationship has been found in the contexts of corporate reputation, food research, and political communication (Kiousis, Kim, McDevitt, & Ostrowski, 2009; Kim & Kiousis, 2012; Weitkamp & Eidsvaag, 2014). Within the realm of politics, research has found correlations between the issues discussed in campaign communications and the issues discussed in news coverage, as was the case during the 2002 Florida gubernatorial elections (Kiousis, Mitrook, Wu, & Seltzer, 2006) and the 2011 Spanish general elections (Ordaz, 2015). Understanding these relationships between the issues presented in information subsidies and those presented in news coverage helps scholars understand how and from whom journalists get information.

In contrast to first-level agenda building, second-level agenda building considers the transfer of frames, which agenda-building researchers often refer to as *object attributes* (Kiousis, 2005). In other words, second-level agenda building addresses the question of whether information subsidies impact the frames utilized by the news media.

Research on the transfer of frames has alternately been labeled as frame-building and as second-level agenda building. Second-level agenda building can be considered a type of emphasis framing research, which seeks to "explore the extent to which an emphasis on certain aspects and details of these objects influence our thoughts and feelings about them" (McCombs, 2014, p. 59). Using this understanding of framing, emphasis frames make attitude objects more salient by encouraging specific thought patterns around those objects (Entman, 1993). As Entman notes, "to frame is to *select*

some aspects of a perceived reality and make them more salient in a communicating text, in such a way as to promote a particular problem definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation, and/or treatment recommendation for the item described" (1993, p. 52). Frames can be defined both by what they include and by what they leave out (ibid). For example, a news article may influence readers' thoughts by leaving out alternative solutions or possible explanations of a problem. Entman's definition of framing fits the conceptualization of first- and second-level agenda building, which seeks to identify not only what issues the news tells us to think about, but also how the news encourages us to think about those issues (McCombs, 1992). This definition of framing is what will be used to define second-level agenda building in this paper.

News frames are implicit, and the journalists employing them often believe them to be an objective reflection of the events that occurred (Gamson, 1984). Even so, frames can have significant implications, particularly for groups seeking legitimacy and voice in the political system. According to Brasted (2005), the way the media frames social movements can lead to public acceptance, or, alternately, to a rejection of the movement's goals. In many cases, activists are portrayed as violent disruptors. In her examination of the coverage of the 1968 Democratic Convention protests, Brasted (2005) found that the news tended to emphasize conflict between protesters and police and often framed activists as "invaders" who were disrupting the social order. The reporting "contributed to delegitimizing and trivializing the protestors and the movement" (p. 23). Another study on the Falklands conflict and disarmament movement demonstrated that the media framed protesters as violent and police as victims of this violence (Glasgow

University Media Group, 1985). Gitlin (1980) similarly noted that the media's framing of protest movements in the 1960s "delegitimized" them. By first ignoring new political voices, and later characterizing them as curiosities instead of legitimate political actors, the media shapes public perceptions of these movements and their policy proposals (Gitlin, 1980).

At the same time, news coverage tends to de-emphasize contextual information or discussions of policy. *New York Times* coverage of the West German Green Party rarely focused on the protesters' political positions and when such discussions were included, they tended to be superficial (Carragee, 1991). Coverage of protest movements tend to focus on protests themselves, rather than on the demands of the activists involved (Glasgow University Media Group, 1985).

This marginalization of protest movements appears to continue to the present day. An analysis of cable news coverage of the conservative Tea Party movement found that all three cable news channels (Fox News, MSNBC, and CNN) framed the movement in ways that marginalized it (Weaver & Scacco, 2010). News organizations also continue to disregard social movements continuing to rely on official sources over activists on matters of policy and politics (Tiffen et al, 2014). This marginalization does not appear to occur across all mediums and outlets, however. An analysis of coverage of the Egyptian Revolution found that while *The New York Times* continued to de-legitimize the protest movement by focusing on the events and relying on official sources, online citizen media and *New York Times* columnist Nicholas Kristof approached their reporting on the events differently, relying on citizens as sources and focusing on their political concerns

(Harlow & Johnson, 2011). As evidence emerges that some journalists may be shifting their framing of protest movements, new examinations of news coverage have become necessary.

The news' framing of certain protest movements may be further complicated when the protesters seek to address issues that seek to dismantle racial inequalities. Research shows that the news media tend to depict black and white subjects in different ways if the subject relates to crime or politics. One study of Chicago news stations found that black activists and politicians were depicted as being more demanding than white activists and politicians (Entman, 1992). The author concluded that these frames encourage hostility toward and rejection of the political goals of black communities. According to Winter (2008), rhetorical issue frames direct news audiences to connect certain political issues with their perceptions of race. News frames of welfare policy, for example, tend to overlap with certain stereotypes of African Americans, which lead audiences to draw connections between welfare and African American beneficiaries of the program (ibid). Although disproportionately negative framing of race and race-related issues can present a challenge for minorities seeking a political voice, they may also find that the media neglects them altogether. In many cases, the issues faced by minority communities are simply ignored by mainstream local media (Heider, 2014).

Digital technologies and citizen participation in the creation of news and content has also changed the framing of events. A study on the use of social media during the Egyptian uprising in 2011 found that governmental news organizations framed the events by discussing the economic consequences and attributing responsibility to others,

whereas social media users tended to invoke human interest frames that classified the uprising as a fight for "freedom and social justice" (Hamdy & Gomaa, 2012). In her book *Affective Publics*, Papacharissi (2015) describes the ways in which networked publics, such as those on social media, capture shared sentiments to contribute to a new form of political expression. These movements, the author argues, are built on "online and offline solidarity shaped around the public display of emotion" (Papacharissi, 2015, 6). As events happened during the Egyptian uprising, the frames employed by both elites and activists were constantly revised and updated (Meraz & Papacharissi, 2013).

As mentioned previously, scholars have contended for decades that political elites almost exclusively shape media coverage and the sphere of public debate (Bennett, 1990; Hänggli, 2012; Gilens and Page, 2014). However, some have increasingly been asking whether social media and the internet are giving more power to marginalized voices, such as those taking part in the Black Lives Matter movement. The next section will address the current literature on social media and activist movements.

Agenda Building in the Internet Age

Recent studies on agenda-building have expanded upon previous studies by including an examination of new actors and digital message mediums. Several recent studies have examined the role of social media, blogs, and mass e-mails in influencing the news agenda (Kiousis et al., 2016a; Kiousis et al., 2015; Kiousis et al., 2016b). So far, the results are inconclusive as to whether social media and internet communications play a role in building the media agenda. One study of political communication efforts during

the 2010 U.S. Senate election in Florida found that the information subsidies with the strongest links to news coverage were traditional news releases, campaign e-mails, and social media, including Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube (Kiousis et al., 2016a). An examination of the 2012 U.S. presidential campaign found that online blogs played a role in agenda building, which led the authors to call for more research into the effectiveness of various types of information, including internet-based subsidies, in agenda building (Kiousis et al., 2015). Another study examining six months of communication by the Obama administration found that the administration's use of Twitter had little effect on setting the media's agenda (Kiousis et al., 2016b). The authors argued that Twitter is "adept at conveying breaking news, but has limited message carrying capacity" (Kiousis et al., 2016b). Taken together, the contradictory findings indicate that more research is needed to better understand the impact of various types of communication on news coverage.

Researchers have also examined the impact of the internet on building frames in the news. Researchers have found evidence that certain media organizations influence the framing employed by other media organizations, a phenomenon called inter-media agenda building (Denham, 2010). One area where this has been observed is between alternative and mainstream media and between online and traditional media (Mathes & Pfetsch, 1991; Lee, Lancendorfer, & Lee, 2005). In one study of news coverage in West Germany, researchers found that issues covered by the alternative media often "spilled over" into mainstream media coverage (Mathes & Pfetsch, 1991). A more recent study of media coverage of general elections in South Korea found that both the topics discussed

and the frames employed on internet bulletin boards influenced subsequent newspaper coverage (Lee, Lancendorfer, & Lee, 2005). A similar transfer of issue framing was uncovered by Zhou and Moy (2007), who found that public comments online appeared to influence media coverage in China both by increasing the issue salience in the media and contributing to frame-building. These studies on the influence of online communications indicate that, with the emergence of the internet, nontraditional actors such as online commenters may be increasingly involved in building the media agenda.

The internet may not only be changing the way that news is framed, but also the way that information is disseminated. Journalists must also adapt their routines to the increasing use of social media by audiences and strategic communicators. Unlike many other information subsidies, social media are often used by strategic communicators to communicate directly to the public. Many campaigns recognize that social media is an inexpensive and expedient way to engage both the public and media professionals (Baxter and Marcella, 2012; Marchetti and Ceccobelli, 2016). In this way, social media provide an avenue to communicate directly with audiences and bypass traditional media gatekeepers (Broersma and Graham, 2012; Paulussen and Harder, 2014). Even though social media may not be used primarily to communicate with journalists, the media can nonetheless play a role in both communicating and disseminating social media information. According to Hermida, "the role of the media professional is to navigate, sift, select and contextualize the vast amounts of data on social awareness streams such as Twitter" (2012, p. 666). Although social media content may not be designed for distribution directly to journalists, Hermida suggests they should nonetheless pay

attention to information online. Hermida lays the foundation for research about how the internet has emerged as a new journalistic source and opens the door for research that seeks to understand the role internet has in building the media's agenda. To that end, researchers have conducted studies to understand the relationship between the internet, particularly social media, agenda building, and agenda setting (Kiousis et al., 2016a; Kiousis et al., 2015; Kiousis et al., 2016b).

In fact, evidence suggests that in many cases journalists turn to Twitter in their work. Because of time and resource constraints, journalists often use Twitter in newsgathering (Parmelee, 2013; Soo & Hadley, 2014). According to his interviews with journalists who covered the 2012 presidential campaigns, Parmelee (2013) found that news professionals frequently used social media platforms to generate ideas, gather quotes and data, find diverse sources, get background information, and fact-check. He also notes the potential for second-level agenda-building relationship because of the use of readily available quotes and data journalists collect from tweets. In examining news coverage of breaking events, Soo and Hadley (2014) found that journalists use Twitter to find information from official sources. In ethnographic research of BBC news practices, Bélair-Gagnon (2013) found that journalists both used social media to share and to collect information. The use of social media, both as a tool for reporting news and for gathering information, has become so ubiquitous that many news organizations have adopted specific protocols for verifying and contextualizing sources and information garnered through social media (Silverman, 2012; Bélair-Gagnon, 2013).

Social media has also become a preferred tool for many activists and organizers who seek to communicate information (Gerbaudo, 2012). Historically, marginalized groups have had difficulty getting their concerns onto the legislative agenda. Groups often, therefore, direct communication through less formal channels, including the media (Cobb and Elder, 1971). Activists and protest movements may find particular benefits from social media. In contrast to traditional media, social media provides marginalized groups with the ability to disseminate information immediately to large audiences at no cost (Grossman, 2009). It also allows activists to easily engage with or persuade likeminded people. For example, Twitter has played a key role in activist activities around the globe, from 2009 anti-government protests in Moldova to the 2011 Arab Spring demonstrations (Barry, 2009; Beaumont, 2011). Within the United States, the platform was used as the primary mode of communication for activist movements such as Occupy Wall Street and Black Lives Matter (Adi, 2015; Fillion, 2014).

Many activist groups have developed sophisticated communication strategies in their use of social media. For example, the social media efforts of Occupy Wall Street demonstrated a high-level understanding of online communication. The various Occupy Wall Street social media accounts were used to promote the movement's image, to share information, and to engage others in dialogue, often with a level of sophistication on par with corporate public relations efforts (Adi, 2015). Activists leading Hong Kong's Umbrella Movement used social media to mobilize and coordinate efforts in real time during protests, while also engaging in debates to attract interest and deepen the involvement of the movement's supporters (Lee and Chan, 2016). During the 2014

protests of teenager Michael Brown in Ferguson, Missouri, Black Lives Matter protesters used Twitter, as well as Tumblr and Facebook, to announce planned demonstrations, solicit donations of money and supplies, and rally supporters (Fillion, 2014). The online communications of these activists make it easy for individuals to connect with movements – but the extent to which journalists also engage with these messages and use them in shaping the news is yet to be fully explored.

Black Lives Matter & Philando Castile

Communications researchers have examined protest movements in the United States since at least the 1960s, when the civil rights movement, early feminist marches, and anti-war demonstrations were frequently the news of the day (Tuchman, 1981). Gitlin's (1980) examination of the 1960s Students for a Democratic Society (SDS) movement demonstrated the role the media plays in recruiting supporters and generating publicity for the cause. The protesters themselves were often aware of the role of the media in their efforts. When, for example, activists at the 1968 Democratic Convention chanted, "the whole world is watching," they understood that journalists were relaying their actions, as well as the actions of police officers who clubbed demonstrators (Gamson, 1984).

Protest movements emerge from perceived opportunities to make meaningful change in the political system (Tarrow, 2011). Since the movements of the 1960s, however, the nature of social movements has begun to shift. According to Larana (1994), a new breed of social movement has emerged that emphasizes identity over ideology.

Whereas many earlier protest movements focused on specific goals, such as nuclear disarmament, the author argues that these new social movements "exhibit a pluralism of ideas and values" and seek a more democratic and decentralized approach to leadership (7). This development occurs alongside the growth of so-called "identity politics," which emphasizes collective experience over clearly defined ideology (Heyes, 2016).

Among the contemporary social movements is Black Lives Matter. Although the Black Lives Matter movement has been compared to the civil rights movement of the 1960s (Harris, 2015), it has many distinct characteristics, which may be attributed to the current state of culture, politics, and technology. Even the movement's beginnings are rooted in the media culture of the 21st century: Black Lives Matter began as a hashtag. In July 2013, Alicia Garza, a 32-year-old Orlando-based advocate against police brutality, posted on Facebook what she called a "love letter to the black people" following the acquittal of George Zimmerman, who had been charged with the shooting death of black 17-year-old Trayvon Martin in Sanford, Florida. Garza signed her post with the words "black people. I love you. I love us. Our lives matter" (Cobb, 2016). A friend later paraphrased the statement in a Twitter hashtag: #BlackLivesMatter (ibid). Although the hashtag immediately gained some traction, it became more widely used on Twitter the next summer following the shooting death of another black teen, Michael Brown, in Ferguson, Missouri (ibid). Many of the people who would become unofficial leaders of the Black Lives Matter movement (e.g., DeRay Mckesson and Johnetta Elzie) traveled to Ferguson to protest the events (ibid). In the wake of Michael Brown's death, protests spread throughout the country in an attempt to draw attention to similar police-involved

deaths of black men and women (Sidner and Simon, 2015). These cases were the first of many that received the attention of Black Lives Matter activists.

Although it began as a movement without clear legislative or political goals, many of its leaders have developed templates for legislative action. One such set of proposals is laid out by Campaign Zero, which outlines ten proposals for legislation and reform at all levels of government ("Solutions," *Campaign Zero*). Another organization, the Movement for Black Lives, calls for divestment from policing in exchange for increased investment in social programs to help minorities ("Platform," *The Movement for Black Lives*). These proposals include improved training of police officers, the use of body cameras, limits to the use of force, and community oversight of policing. The movement has been compared to other modern activist campaigns, particularly Occupy Wall Street, which has also successfully used social media to organize demonstrations around the world (Hunter & Polk, 2016). Unlike Black Lives Matter, Occupy Wall Street began not in response to a specific event, but as a general call to protest consumerism and corporate influence in American democracy (Fleming, 2011). The movements are different in other important ways. To begin, the Occupy movement received much more support from the public and politicians alike. While Occupy Wall Street enjoyed the support of 59 percent of Americans polled, only 43 percent expressed support for Black Lives Matter (Cooper, 2011; Horowitz & Livingston, 2016). Relatedly, the aims of Occupy Wall Street were acknowledged and embraced by many politicians, including then-President Barack Obama and 2012 Libertarian Party presidential candidate Gary Johnson (Downs, 2011; Memoli, 2011). Some politicians hesitated to express direct

support for the Black Lives Matter movement, however, and many have been overtly hostile toward the movement (Weigel, 2016). In many cases, these disagreements mirror partisan differences. The movements, too, critique different institutions which receive different levels of public support. During the height of the Occupy Wall Street movement, trust in banks and financial institutions was at an all-time low, receiving support from just 11 percent of Americans in one poll (Owens, 2011). Amid Black Lives Matter protests, support for police was also at a historic low, but law enforcement still received support from a majority – 52 percent – of Americans (Jones, 2015). Black Lives Matter and Occupy Wall Street received very different levels of support, both from politicians and the public, which suggests they may experience different levels of support at the legislative level, as well.

Since the first protests following the deaths of Trayvon Martin and Michael Brown, activists have focused their attention on cases around the country that they viewed as examples of racial bias or excessive use of force. In the state of Minnesota, Castile's death occurred at a time of already-heightened tension. Less than a year earlier, in November 2015, another black Minnesota man named Jamar Clark was shot and killed by police. The details of Clark's shooting were disputed by officials and witnesses. While the county attorney and the Minneapolis police department held that a struggle preceded the shooting, witnesses described a compliant Clark whose hands were behind his back (Nelson, 2015; Walsh & Jany, 2015). Black Lives Matter activists and the local Justice 4 Jamar coalition staged protests in the months that followed (Holpuch, 2015). In March

2016, the county attorney announced that no charges would be brought against the officers involved ("What we know about the death of Jamar Clark," 2016).

Castile's death occurred only three months after the county attorney's announcement. On July 6, 2016, the day Castile was killed, many prominent Black Lives Matter activists were making their way to Baton Rouge, Louisiana, to protest the death of another black man, Alton Sterling, who was killed by police officers the night before (Alcindor, 2016). Although some facts of Castile's case are disputed (e.g., Capecchi & Smith, 2016), many details are clear. Castile was killed following a traffic stop for a broken taillight in the St. Paul suburb of Falcon Heights, Minnesota, by Jeronimo Yanez, a member of the nearby St. Anthony Police Department (Shapiro et al., 2016). Castile's girlfriend, Diamond Reynolds, livestreamed on Facebook the moments immediately following the shooting, while Castile moaned and bled from his wounds (ibid). The news and Reynolds' video received immediate national attention.

The day after Castile's death, hundreds of people attended a vigil at the school where he had worked. Following the vigil, many attendees marched to the governor's mansion, where demonstrators placed yellow crime-scene tape along the mansion fence in protest (Shapiro et al., 2016). Many in the crowd, including journalists, offered snapshots and observations from the scene, posting on Twitter under the hashtag #PhilandoCastile. Simultaneous demonstrations against police violence occurred in New York, Dallas, Washington, and Chicago (Knoll, 2016). The protests in Dallas turned deadly when a gunman killed five police officers and wounded several others, allegedly in retaliation for the black men killed by police (Fernandez, Pérez-Peña, & Bromwich,

2016). Later that night, about 100 protesters blocked traffic at an intersection in St. Paul by moving construction materials onto the road (Shapiro et al., 2016). Many people, including Minnesota governor Mark Dayton, blamed racism for Castile's death (Shapiro et al., 2016). Deray Mckesson, a prominent Black Lives Matter activist, wrote on Twitter: "Philando Castile should be alive today…I don't know what else to say…He should be alive today. He is not alive because a police officer murdered him in cold blood" (Shapiro et al., 2016). Many others, including celebrities, took to the social medium to express anger or sadness at the deaths both of Castile and Alton Sterling (Prakash, 2016).

The protests continued for several days following the shooting and received support from many national figures, including Jesse Jackson, who visited the area two days after Castile's death (Chanen, 2016). On the night of July 9, however, protesters shut down I-94 in St. Paul and caused injury to 21 police officers by throwing fireworks, rocks, and bottles, leading to the arrest of more than 100 people (Walsh, 2016). That same night, protesters also stopped traffic in downtown Minneapolis (ibid). Protests continued around the country over the next days (Madhani, 2016). Although the protest activity eventually decreased, activists and mourners continued to hold periodic demonstrations and vigils over the following months (Zamora, 2016; Sawyer, 2016; "1 arrested"). Some of the protests also happened online – using #PhilandoCastile, many acquaintances paid tribute to Castile, while others protested gun laws, police brutality, and the treatment of black victims by the media (Callahan, 2016). As is the case with many hashtags associated with Black Lives Matter, some of those who tweeted were

involved with the movement, but many others were merely inspired to participate by the details of this particular event.

Although in many ways Castile's case resembled the deaths of other black people by police, it was also unique in several significant ways. Castile's case occurred in a state that has been taking seriously the concerns of activists who seek changes to police policies. For example, the previous death of Jamar Clark already led to calls to action from the public and political officials to address the use of force against minorities by police officers ("Minneapolis NAACP chief," 2015; "Minneapolis Seeks Civil Rights Investigation," 2015). Castile's shooting also elicited swift reactions by protesters and the public due to the seeming recklessness of it, as both Diamond Reynolds and her 4-year-old daughter were in the car at the time of the shooting ("Girlfriend of Philando Castile," 2016). Reynolds' livestreaming of the aftermath of the shooting also made the case unique. Although numerous cases, including those of Eric Garner and Tamir Rice, were recorded on cell phones or security cameras and later disseminated through the news media and online, Castile's last minutes were immediately spread, eliciting an immediate response on social media, even before Castile was pronounced dead and his name was released to the public. As Reynolds was streaming the video, users could interact in real time, one urging her to continue streaming (Stelter, 2016).

Castile's case was also one in which the officer involved did not immediately offer a thorough defense of his actions to the media. Although Castile was carrying a gun, he had a permit and informed the officer that he was in possession of a weapon (Forliti & Potter, 2016). Yanez's own attorney asserted that his client was reacting to the "presence

of a gun," but failed to elaborate on any threatening behavior on Castile's part (Gurman & Foreman, 2016). Public officials, and particularly Minnesota governor Mark Dayton, were quick to attribute the shooting to racial bias on the part of the officer (Lopez, 2017). In a public response to Castile's death that was quickly condemned by police groups, Dayton said: "Would this have happened…if the driver and passenger would have been white? I don't think so" (Stassen-Berger, 2016). In sum, Castile was treated differently than past victims of police violence: he was mourned by public officials, his funeral was held in the St. Paul cathedral, and numerous news stories depicted him as a hard-working and kind-hearted member of the community (Louwagie & Van Berkel, 2016; Horner & Melo, 2016).

For journalists, such a case presented certain challenges and constraints. The presence of a video documenting the moments after Castile was shot limits the ways in which the story can be framed. The appearance of Castile swaying and moaning while Reynolds slowly came to terms with the situation, as well as the heart-wrenching interjections of Reynolds' four-year-old daughter, may have limited the frames journalists can use in their reporting. Furthermore, the lack of a strong defense for the officer involved may have limited the ways journalists could present the case. Whether journalists continued to rely on traditional patterns of reporting on the subsequent protests is the focus of the current study.

Although Castile's case and the Black Lives Matter movement are unique, they also present an opportunity for researchers to examine the agenda-building impact of activists' tweets in comparison to more traditional sources information. Black Lives

Matter has become one of the most prominent activist movements in the United States (Horowitz & Livingstone, 2016). The use of social media, and particularly Twitter, by its unofficial leaders and supporters will allow the researcher to examine the impact, if any, of the movement's communications on media coverage. Castile's case received nationwide attention in the news media and on social media and it also occurred in the wake of other notable police-involved shootings (including the death of Alton Sterling and its subsequent protests, as well as the shooting of police officers in Dallas as retaliation).

Based on the literature reviewed, this study seeks to answer the following research questions in relation to the Philando Castile case study:

RQ1: Which political and social issues do Black Lives Matter activists, official sources, and news articles discuss in relation to the death of Philando Castile?

RQ2: Which frames do activists, official sources, and news articles use to discuss Castile's death?

RQ3: How often are activists and elites quoted or referenced in news articles?

RQ4: How often do news articles include quotes or information from social media?

RQ5: What is the relationship between the activists' tweets and media coverage?

RQ6: What is the relationship between official/elite sources and media coverage?

RQ7: How does the relationship between activists' tweets and media coverage differ between partisan and mainstream media outlets?

METHODS

To answer the research questions posed in this study, I use both qualitative and quantitative methods. To first identify the political and social issues related to Philando Castile's death, I qualitatively coded the data through open coding. During this phase of data analysis, I developed I developed a simplified codebook to measure the issues discussed, frames employed, and for news articles, the sources cited. I used this codebook to conduct a quantitative content analysis to test the first- and second-level agenda building relationships between activists' social media and news media and between traditional information sources and the news media.

Sampling

Castile's death occurred on July 6, 2016. Because of the live stream of his death, which was broadcast by his girlfriend (Diamond Reynolds), went viral the shooting received national attention almost immediately. Protests took place in Minneapolis and elsewhere for several days following the event, and press coverage continued for several weeks. During the month of July, protesters held frequent demonstrations in Minnesota's Twin Cities area. After a final protest in St. Paul on August 5, in which six people were arrested, no protest activities related to Castile's death were documented by the news media or by protesters for several weeks. This month-long period, from July 6, 2016 through August 6, 2016, represents the heaviest period of protest activities and news coverage related to Castile's death and is the focus of this study. (See Appendix D for a timeline of events during this month-long period.)

Activist Tweets

The tweets selected for analysis include those of prominent Black Lives Matter activists at the state and national levels, as well as participants in local demonstrations and online observers employing specific hashtags related to Castile's death. I collected a total of 508 tweets from the accounts of 12 local and national activists and 121 tweets from 3 accounts representing the movement. The tweets were collected between January and April 2017 using Twitter's advanced search function. I removed from the set all irrelevant tweets (e.g., those of a personal nature). All other tweets were used for analysis.

Activists were selected for inclusion if they met three criteria: (1) they were active on Twitter during the month-long period; (2) they had 100 or more followers when the data was collected; and (3) they discussed Castile's death on their accounts. The activists were identified using snowball sampling, beginning with those activists quoted in news articles about Castile's death and then seeking those other activists with whom the initial sample interacted on Twitter. Activists included in this study are Black Lives Matter co-founder Alicia Garza (@aliciagarza), who has 13,600 followers; activist and co-founder of Campaign Zero Brittany Packnett (@MsPackyetti), who has 63,000 followers; Baltimore-based activist DeRay Mckesson (@deray), who has 196,000 followers; Chicago-based activist Ja'Mal Green (@JaymalGreen), who has 52,100 followers; activist Johnetta Elzie (@Nettaaaaaaaa), who has 207,000 followers; Minnesota-based activist Mica Grimm (@micamaryjane), who has 66,400 followers; Black Lives Matter co-founder Opal Tometi (@opalayo), who has 12,900 followers; Black Lives Matter co-

founder Patrisse Cullors (@osope), who has 33,000 followers; Minnesota-based activist Rashad Turner (@RashadsRepublic), who has 1,400 followers; Texas-based activist Dominque Alexander (@niquealex), who has 4,000 followers; activist and Campaign Zero cofounder Samuel Sinyangwe (@samswey), who has 48,000 followers; and activist Ilyasah Shabazz (@ilyasahShabazz), who has 80,600 followers.

In addition to activist Twitter accounts, an additional three Twitter accounts were included in this study. These Twitter accounts were included because they were the black activist organizations identified in media accounts during the initial round of qualitative analysis. Organizations that did not have Twitter accounts, that were not active during the sample period, that had fewer than 100 followers, or that did not mention Castile's death were excluded from analysis. Twitter accounts representing the Black Lives Matter movement included the national Black Lives Matter account (@Blklivesmatter), which has 234,000 followers; Black Lives Matter Minneapolis (@BlackLivesMpls), which has 29,200 followers; and TCC4Justice (@TCC4Justice), an organization with 235 followers that was first formed to seek justice in the death of Jamar Clarke and later participated in protests over Castile's death.

Traditional Agenda Builders

Beyond activists, I examined traditional elites, who historically have been the primary builders of the media's agenda (e.g. public officials and governmental bodies). These sources of information included tweets, press releases, and public statements

released by traditional agenda builders. The set included 237 items for analysis from 46 sources. It included 53 press releases and 184 tweets, all of which were used for analysis.

I chose several government organizations and agencies that issued public comments on the Castile case, including police departments, non-profit organizations, and politicians. These sources (n = 46) were identified during the first round of qualitative analysis. Following Kleemans et al., (2015), these elites included government agencies, experts, politicians, nonprofit and religious organizations, public organizations, and law enforcement. Sources that were explicitly identified in newspaper articles were included in this analysis. Additional sources were identified through Google searches for politicians, nonprofits, religious organizations, and governmental organizations, both nationally and in the Twin Cities area. Organizations that did not issue official responses to Castile's death were excluded from analysis. All other organizations were included in analysis.

The press releases (n = 53) and tweets (n = 184) used for analysis were found through online searches of archives associated with the various organizations and politicians. Police department sources included the St. Anthony (the police department which employs Officer Yanez) and St. Paul Police Departments and the Bureau of Criminal Apprehension, as well as police unions, including Law Enforcement Labor Services, which represents Minnesota police officers; the Minnesota Police and Peace Officers Association; and the St. Paul Police Federation, which represents St. Paul officers. Political officials included Minnesota Governor Mark Dayton; Lieutenant Governor Tina Smith; U.S. Representative Betty McCollum; U.S. Representative Keith

Ellison; U.S. Senator Al Franken; U.S. Senator Amy Klobuchar; U.S. Representative Tim Walz; State Senator Terri Bonoff; St. Paul Mayor Chris Coleman; President Barack Obama; and Minnesota DFL Party Chairman Ken Martin. Also included were local Minnesota governments and governing bodies that issued statements: the Ramsey County Attorney's Office, which headed the case against Yanez, and the City of St. Anthony, where Yanez was employed as a police officer. Nonprofit organizations and advocacy groups that were used for analysis included the NAACP Minneapolis, the National Rifle Association, St. Paul Amnesty International, People for the American Way, AFL-CIO, and Education Minnesota. Many of these organizations released statements only through their local or national offices; when available, statements from both offices were used. Religious groups included the Presbytery of the Twin Cities area, the Archdiocese of Minneapolis-St. Paul, and the progressive Jewish organization Workmen's Circle. Other organizations included for analysis were the St. Paul Federation of Teachers, because many of its members were coworkers of Castile's; the local Teamsters union, of which Castile was a member; Facebook, which hosted the live-stream of Castile's death; and St. Paul Schools, where Castile was employed.

News Article Samples

Finally, I sampled from a range of news articles to compare and contrast relationships among different types of print journalism. Specifically, I examined national, local, and online-only news and commentary sites. The sample included a total of 344

articles. All the newspapers were found and downloaded on ProQuest Newsstand using the specified date range and the search terms "Philando Castile."

First, the *New York Times* (n = 29) and the *Washington Post* (n = 20) as national papers were included. The *New York Times* has a daily print circulation of 571,000 in addition to more than 2 million digital subscribers in 195 countries ("New York Times," 2017). *New York Times* readers have a median age of 40 and are higher income earners, with a median household income of $99,000 ("The *New York Times* Media Kit") and is considered the national paper of record. Meanwhile, the *Washington Post*'s daily circulation is about 359,000; its online edition has a worldwide reach ("General Ad Rates"). Information on the *Washington Post*'s readers was not available.

In addition, the *Minneapolis Star-Tribune* (n = 37) and the *St. Paul Pioneer Press* (n = 58), the two papers with the largest circulations in the state of Minnesota ("Top 10," 2015), were included in this study. These papers both serve the Twin Cities media market, which is among the top markets in the country for both household income and voter turnout ("*StarTribune* Media Kit"). *Star Tribune* readers tend to be highly educated and tech-savvy; the newspaper's website receives nearly 7 million unique visitors each month (ibid). The *Pioneer Press* has about 2.7 million unique visitors to its website each month ("Reach. Response. Results."). About 67 percent of readers have attended college and about 39 percent are over the age of 55 (ibid). Both papers covered Castile's death and its aftermath extensively.

Finally, the sample included four partisan, online-only publications. The articles from each of these news organizations were collected through each site's individual

archives or search feature. This sample provided a diversity of print media types with varying news audiences, which allowed me to compare agenda-building effects. I selected two left-leaning outlets, the *Huffington Post* (n = 58) and *The Root* (n = 34), which focuses on stories pertaining to African American issues, as well as two right-leaning outlets, *The Daily Caller* (n = 25) and *Breitbart* (n = 83), a far-right site that often tackles issues of race. The *Huffington Post,* one of the first only-only news outlets and the first online outlet to with a Pulitzer Prize, receives about 79 million unique monthly visitors ("Properties," 2017). *The Root* is owned by Gizmodo Media Group, a part of Univision Communications, and targets an audience primarily of African-American readers (Bond, 2015). It receives about 6.5 million unique visitors each month ("Advertise on *The Root,*" 2016). *The Daily Caller* has about 15 million unique monthly viewers who are politically engaged and tend to be registered to vote as independents or Republicans ("Advertise with Us," 2017). Finally, *Breitbart* has made headlines for its provocative headlines and stories regarding a variety of topics, including race- and gender-related issues (Bromwich, 2016). It received 37 million unique views in the month of October 2016 ("Breitbart News," 2016).

Issue Identification

To identify the issues that were discussed in relation to the shooting death of Philando Castile and the Black Lives Matter movement, I conducted a qualitative content analysis of the tweets, other information subsidies, and newspaper articles.

I examined these texts using iterative analysis, which Tracy (2012) notes "alternates between emic, or emergent, readings of the data and an etic use of existing models, explanations, and theories" (p. 184). This iterative analysis allowed me to develop a catalog of issues discussed across the different units of analysis. Although I approached the sampled material with background knowledge and an understanding of agenda-building theory, I also allowed new or unexpected understandings to emerge from the text. Data was manually color-coded. Although my primary focus was on identifying the policy-related and social issues discussed in these various texts, I also looked for other commonalities within my sample.

To thoroughly examine the data qualitatively, I went through four phases of coding, which allowed me to move back and forth between emic and etic readings of the text. First, I began with a data immersion phase, in which I familiarized myself with the data and noticed any emerging themes or concepts (Tracy, 2012, 188). Second, I embarked on my first cycle of coding, in which I used descriptive and *in vivo* codes to examine the sample. Descriptive coding, according to Saldaña (2015), is a process whereby the researcher "summarizes in a word or short phrase – most often as a noun – the basic topic of a passage of qualitative data" (p. 88). This gave me a sense for the topics regularly discussed across these different media, as well as common themes or tones employed. Through *in vivo* coding, I also examined commonly used words or phrases, which later helped illuminate whether the news media borrowed terminology from protesters and their social media communications. As Saldaña (2015) notes, *in vivo* coding is particularly appropriate for research that seeks to "prioritize and honor the

participant's voice," as well as for examining marginalized groups and individuals who may have unique vocabularies or commonly used phrases (p. 91). By searching for connections between those words and phrases employed by protesters and the news articles reporting on the protests, I could determine whether the protesters' social media use appeared to have an impact on reporting.

Third, after this first cycle of coding, I conducted a second round of coding in which I categorized and collapsed my initial codes, as necessary. My focus in this stage was to refine my codes into a systematic codebook that includes the code name, a short description of the code, a more detailed description of the code, criteria for inclusion and exclusion, and typical and atypical exemplars, as recommended by Bernard and Ryan (2010, p. 99). Doing so allowed me to quantify the relationships between sources and news coverage in the second stage of my project, as well as to more easily draw connections for my qualitative analysis.

Fourth, once I collapsed my codes into well-defined categories, I pulled out commonalities and recorded my observations using analytic memos. These memos allowed me to take notes on my observations and find meaning and connections among texts and codes, helping me determine the "fundamental stories in the data" (Tracy, 2012, p. 196). From there, I could craft a narrative about what I noticed.

Testing Relationships

The first part of my study identified which issues were most salient in the case of Philando Castile and how activists, official sources, and news outlets framed Castile's

death. This data was used to develop a codebook which was subsequently used to conduct a quantitative content analysis on the full sample of tweets, information subsidies, and news articles to examine the correlations between activists and media coverage and traditional information sources and media coverage. Spearman's rho (1904) was used to calculate these correlations.

Each tweet, information subsidy, and news article was coded along two dimensions to examine both first- and second-level agenda building. To test whether first-level agenda building relationships exist, I coded every case for the issue(s) discussed, using my codebook from part 1 of the data analysis. For each case, all issues were coded as present (1) or not present (2). Some cases discussed multiple issues, and coding for multiple issues was allowed.

To examine possible second-level agenda building relationships, I relied on a coding protocol adapted from Kiousis, Kim, McDevitt, and Ostrowski (2009) (see Appendix C). The frames employed in the Kiousis et al. study were based on tested measures from many agenda setting studies, and variations on this protocol have been used numerous times (see Kiousis et al., 2009 for examples). For each unit of analysis, I coded for one of the following frames: conflict, cooperation (harmony), problem/issue definition, attribution of responsibility, human interest, and morality (Kiousis et al., 2009). If more than one frame was present in a unit of analysis, I coded the dominant frame only; in other words, only one frame was assigned to each tweet, article, or statement. I judged the most dominant frame by determining which most strongly conveyed the message of the article, tweet, or press release. In the case of press releases

and news articles, this was determined by the framing of the headline and lead paragraphs.

Intercoder Reliability

As is customary in quantitative content analyses, a portion of the cases were manually coded by a second coder to ensure reliability. The second coder was trained using the codebook I developed. Training included a review of the codebook, a discussion of relevant examples, and several rounds of practice coding. The reliability of each variable is reported to ensure that each individual measure meets reliability standards, as recommended by Riffe, Lacy, and Fico (2014). Krippendorff's alpha (2004) is used as a reliability measure in this study with an acceptable level of .7, a level at which the risk for accepting unreliable data is very low (Hayes & Krippendorff, 2007).

I achieved acceptable reliability for all coding categories. Krippendorff's alpha ranged from 0.76 to 1, with one category as undefined because no instances were found in the reliability subset. (See Table 1 for full details on the intercoder reliability alphas.)

Table 1. Intercoder Reliability		
	Krippendorf's Alpha	Percent Agreement
Issues		
Gun control	1	100.0%
Police revenue	1	100.0%
Body cameras	0.89	99.4%
Open-carry	0.88	97.4%
Second Amendment	0.76	97.4%
Community policing	1	100.0%
Police reform (other)	0.78	96.8%
Diversifying police	0.89	96.1%
Police training	1	100.0%
Police accountability	0.83	98.7%
***In vivo* codes**		
"systemic racism"	0.83	92.9%
"epidemic"	0.85	99.4%
"implicit bias"	1	100.0%
"privilege"	undefined	100.0%
"white supremacy"	1	100.0%
"murder"	1	100.0%
Sources		
Tweets	1	100.0%
Activists	0.77	96.8%
Officials/Elites	0.77	91.6%
Frames	0.76	85.1%

RESULTS

The results of this study are presented in four parts. I begin by describing the issues related to policing that were identified as part of the qualitative coding of articles, tweets, and press releases. Then, I identify the types of sources used by news outlets in their reporting, including differences between the types of news outlets. Third, I outline the quantitative relationship between the issues identified in source material (tweets and

press releases) and the issues identified in news articles. Finally, I describe the quantitative relationship between the frames used in source material and those used in news articles.

Issues

The first goal of this paper was to uncover the issues discussed by activists, official sources, and the news media in relation to Philando Castile's death and the protests that followed. Qualitative analysis revealed 49 codes, including 43 descriptive and six *in vivo* codes, which were then collapsed into 37 distinct codes. These codes were then combined into 16 subcategories, and finally were combined into seven categories (for the full codebook, see Appendix A and B). Throughout this section, a unit refers to the tweet, statement, or news article being coded. The seven categories are described below and are presented and grouped to most effectively illustrate the themes in the sample.

Category 1: CASE-SPECIFIC DESCRIPTIONS

Units in this category detail the case and context of the death of Philando Castile and protests relating to his death. Many of the newspaper articles, as well as a portion of the information subsidies, focused on laying out the facts of Philando Castile's case and the subsequent protests. The language employed, as well as the ways in which the case were discussed (for example, by humanizing the Castile or the police officer who shot him), varied depending on the source of information. This category contains three

subcategories (description of events, humanizing actors, and references to other cases) and seven codes (description of case & description of protests; cooperation between protesters & police; and "murder" or "murdered").

Subcategory: Description of shooting & protests

Units coded in this subcategory describe the events and details of Castile's death and the subsequent protests. This subcategory included any fact-based statements about Castile's shooting and death or Reynolds' recording of the event, or about the protests following Castile's death. It did not include descriptions of other cases or expressions of emotions. Tweets, information subsidies, and news articles all included descriptions of Castile's shooting and of the protests that followed. Essential facts of the case were laid out by the medical examiner, the county attorney's office, and Diamond Reynolds' statements during her livestream of the aftermath of the shooting. Different sources discussed the events in varying ways, however. Ramsey County Attorney John Choi and other public officials urged caution in interpreting the facts of the case before a thorough investigation was concluded. Meanwhile, others were quoted in news articles or tweeted responses using the terms "murder," "murdered," "assassinated," or "executed" to describe Castile's killing and the killings of other black individuals by police. Rashad Turner, a St. Paul-based Black Lives Matter activist, tweeted in response to a state representative who spoke on Castile's death, "Stop co-opting Philando Catiles murder! [sic]" (July 22). An essay in the *Huffington Post* described the killings of Castile and

Alton Sterling and as "on-the-spot executions" (July 7). These terms were most often employed by activists or in left-leaning online publications.

Although less frequent, some news articles and public officials also cited instances of cooperation, particularly between protesters and police. For example, one *Pioneer Press* article (July 12) detailed St. Paul Police Commander Steve Anderson's efforts to facilitate the protests with the help of organizers. Activists online rejected these narratives of cooperation, however. A tweet from Black Lives Matter Minneapolis (July 26) stated, "police escalating and using force against peaceful protesters."

Subcategory: Humanizing actors

Units coded in this subcategory include characterizations of Castile and Officer Jeronimo Yanez that serve to humanize them. This subcategory included descriptions of the life or background of Castile or police officer Jeronimo Yanez, including statements from friends, family, or coworkers of either man. It did not include discussions of other people, such as other victims of police violence. Both news organizations and activists also sought to humanize either Castile or Yanez. Most frequently, newspapers and activists sought to paint Castile as a good-hearted and hard-working cafeteria supervisor at a St. Paul school. He was pulled over frequently by police, as several news outlets noted, and struggled to stay on top of the mounting cost of traffic fines. A statement from the St. Paul Public Schools (July 8), which employed Castile, noted that "[c]olleagues describe him as a team player who maintained great relationships with staff and students alike. He had a cheerful disposition and his colleagues enjoyed working with him. He

was quick to greet former coworkers with a smile and hug." A *Washington Post* article (July 10) described his sister's last conversation with him, in which they were planning his coming birthday celebration at a local amusement park. Friends, colleagues, and family members were frequently quoted in mainstream news articles describing his personality and character.

Although the details of Yanez's life and personality were not explored to the same extent as Castile's, a few news articles did attempt to humanize the police officer, as well. One *New York Times* article (July 9) detailed his career and noted that Yanez was recently married and had a child. A *Washington Post* article (July 11) quoted one of Yanez's former professors, who said he had a "servant's heart." Yanez was rarely mentioned by name in activists' tweets or outside the mainstream newspapers, however.

Subcategory: References to other cases

Units coded in this subcategory made comparisons to other cases of police-involved violence, gun violence, or police actions. This subcategory included references to the recent death of Alton Sterling, references to the shootings of police officers in Dallas, and references to other cases of police-involved shootings, violence against police officers, or other mass shootings. General references to violence were not included. Castile's death occurred between two other significant events that brought worldwide attention to police-involved shootings. Alton Sterling, who was killed the day before Castile, and the killings of five police officers in Dallas the day after Castile's death, were both frequently mentioned in news articles about Castile. Articles, press statements,

and activists' tweets also referenced other police-involved shooting victims, including Trayvon Martin, Michael Brown, and Jamar Clark. Korryn Gaines, who was killed by police on August 1, 2016, was also mentioned, particularly in activists' tweets toward the end of the sampling period. Some activists, press statements, and news articles also referenced other non-police-related gun violence, including the Orlando nightclub shooting, which occurred the month before.

Left- and right-leaning media organizations also employed anecdotal evidence of comparable cases involving police and white suspects. These anecdotes were used to support claims for or against the assertion of racial bias in police-involved shootings. The *Huffington Post*, for example, used the case of Dylann Roof, a white man who killed nine members of an African American church before being arrested unharmed (July 11). On the other hand, *Breitbart* (July 15) referred to the example of Dylan Noble, a 19-year-old white man who was unarmed when he was shot and killed by police, to assert that racial bias was not a factor in Castile's case.

Category 2: POLICING ISSUES

Units coded in this category define problems with and solutions to the current state of policing in the United States or specific jurisdictions. The sample set included references to policy and social issues related to policing. These include challenges that police officers face, as well as proposals for changes or improvements to the way police operate. By far the most common call by activists, public officials, and nonprofits was for accountability of the officer involved in Castile's case, as well as accountability and

transparency in all cases of police-involved deaths. This category includes two subcategories (challenges to policing and police reforms) and 10 codes (gun control, police revenue, racial profiling, open-carry, body cameras, community policing, police accountability, diversifying police, police training, and police reform (other)/privatizing police).

Subcategory: Challenges to policing

Units coded in this subcategory referred to legal, social, or political challenges such as government policy or racial discrimination that interfere with effective or fair policing. This subcategory included calls for increased gun control, discussions of revenue sources for police officers, discussions or descriptions of racial profiling, and references to open- or concealed-carry laws. It did not include issues not directly related to police policy, such as general government expenditures. Often mentioned were several issues that many felt made policing more difficult for officers. Gun control was one such issue. While many, including Attorney General Loretta Lynch, asserted that increased gun control could improve relations between police officers and communities, others claimed the opposite. Yafeuh Balogun, co-founder of the Huey P. Newton Gun Club, was quoted in the *New York Times* (July 13) as saying that if more minorities bore arms legally, they can protect themselves while also increasing the respect given by law enforcement.

Another frequently cited complication is the use of racial profiling of minorities by police. News articles, activists, and some public officials blamed racial profiling for

Castile's death or, more generally, for tense relations between police officers and the communities they serve. In a statement that was swiftly condemned by police unions and the right-wing media, Minnesota Governor Mark Dayton said: "Would this have happened if these passengers – the driver and the passengers – were white? I don't think it would've." Although Dayton's statement was rebuked by some, the sentiment was echoed by others, including U.S. Representative Elijah Cummings, an African American, who described being pulled over "50 million times" without clear cause (*Huffington Post*, July 7). Minnesota-based Black Lives Matter activist Mica Grimm responded sarcastically on Twitter to media reports that Castile had been pulled over by police dozens of times: "update: it appears #PhilandoCastile was a black man in America (of course he's been pulled over)" (July 7).

One final challenge for police that was particularly pertinent in Castile's case is open-carry and concealed-carry laws. At the time of his shooting, Castile was carrying a gun, for which he had a legal permit. The lawyer for police officer Jeronimo Yanez claimed his client fired on Castile not due to his race, but due to the "presence of a gun." This led some to call for a discussion on open- and concealed-carry laws that may make it more difficult for police officers to make appropriate judgments in tense situations.

Subcategory: Police reforms

Units coded in this subcategory referred to proposals for improving policing to make it more effective and fair. This subcategory included specific descriptions of or calls for the implementation of body camera policies, discussions of community policing

policies, calls for accountability in cases of police violence, calls for greater diversity on police forces, calls for more or different police training (including implicit bias training), and other calls for police reform. This subcategory did not include references to policing challenges, such as racial profiling or funding, unless specifically calling for reform. Suggestions and calls for reforms to policing were more frequent than the descriptions of the challenges officers faced. By far the most frequent call was for accountability of officers. Many public officials, nonprofit and advocacy organizations, and activists called for a thorough and fair investigation into Castile's killing. At the same time, many also called for greater accountability for police officers in general. One article in *The Root* (July 16) cited a research study that found that a small fraction of Chicago police officers accounted for about a quarter of total complaints. Others noted the failure of the justice system to hold other officers involved in similar deaths accountable. *Breitbart* (July 18) cited an interview with Malik Zulu Shabazz, a former chairman for the New Black Panther Party, who said: "until the court system works, there can't be no peace."

Most of the calls for accountability, however, were specifically directed at the police officer responsible for Castile's death. Diamond Reynolds, in an interview following the shooting, said of Yanez: "He should not be home with his family. He should be somewhere in jail, handcuffed" (*Daily Caller*, July 8). Activists tweeted similar sentiments, while others drew upon the Castile case as an illustration of larger problems. The Twin Cities-based advocacy organization Justice for Jamar tweeted: "Indict convict send killer kkkkops to jail the whole damn system is guilty as hell #PhilandoCastile"

(July 10). This tweet is illustrative of the frustration and lack of faith in the justice system that many activists expressed online and in the media.

Although holding police responsible was the most commonly mentioned proposal to reform policing, numerous articles, tweets, and official press statements offered other solutions. One frequently cited solution to increase or improve police training. Some articles described and analyzed a "Bulletproof Warrior" training Yanez attended, which many viewed as exacerbating the problems between police and the public. Some public officials called for diversity or implicit-bias training that would specifically teach officers to question and overcome their prejudices. For example, a *Pioneer Press* article outlined the slow implementation of a $1.5-million training program in the Twin Cities that sought to improve relations with communities of color (July 15). Similarly, Black Lives Matter activist Brittany Packnett called for training cops techniques to deescalate dangerous situations: "#DeescalateDontKill makes sense when cops walk into a hostile situation," she tweeted (July 16).

Like the call for more or better training, some public officials and activists also highlighted or suggested community policing programs to address racial tensions between police and citizens. In the wake of the shootings of Dallas police officers, the *New York Times* described the efforts of Dallas Police Chief David O. Brown, who sought to increase community policing in the Dallas neighborhoods (July 13). According to the *Huffington Post*, activists also called for diversifying police forces to improve community relations (July 7). Minnesota Senator Amy Klobuchar proposed "diversity in hiring" to increase trust and accountability (July 8).

Activists also called for officers to wear body cameras. Although Castile's shooting was not captured by a body camera, Diamond Reynolds' Facebook Live recording provided an account of the minutes immediately following. While activists took the opportunity to again call for the use of body cameras, other sources – including one article in *Breitbart* (July 16) – suggested cellphone videos captured by bystanders could also serve as an important tool for holding police officers accountable for their actions.

Sources offered a myriad of other suggestions to improve policing. Some of these calls were general, like activist Opal Tometi's statement: "Reform of the current system will not suffice…We must transform it" (*Huffington Post*, July 21). Jamira Birley, campaign manager for Amnesty International USA, demanded that the laws governing use of force be changed immediately (July 7). More extreme proposals included activist Alicia Garza's call for the abolition of policing (July 13) and activist Patrisse Cullors' similar call to defund police departments (July 12). In a Twitter post, Tometi put her suggestion bluntly: "Let's make this plain: Nothing short of divesting from 'policing' can solve this crisis." Meanwhile, two *Daily Caller* writers offered their own solution: a push for privatization of policing to increase accountability (July 13). The writers cited cases in which private security officers were immediately disciplined for violent actions.

Category 3: ADVICE

Units coded in this category offer advice or calls to action to address the issue of police brutality. Many of the sources, particularly left-leaning publications and online

activists, offered suggestions for what individuals could do to help the Black Lives Matter cause, to improve race relations, or to protect minority youth from violent police encounters. Some of these suggestions were general (like calls for greater understanding and tolerance), while many were highly specific. This category includes two subcategories (advice for groups, calls to action) and four codes (advice for black people, advice for white people, advice for parents/educators, and calls to action).

Subcategory: Advice for groups

Units coded in this subcategory offered advice to a group or groups of people on matters of police-related violence or racial inequity. This subcategory included advice from a particular person or organization offered to a specific group in order to address issues stemming from police violence. It did not include any advice that was not given serious (i.e., satirical advice). The sample included instances of advice issued to different groups of people, including black people, white people, and parents or educators of minority children. Much of the advice for black people focused on how to appropriately deal with police. In a YouTube video that was reported on by the *Huffington Post* (July 11), black country singer Coffey Anderson instructed other black people on how they should act when they are pulled over by police. Others discussed advice they had received from parents or friends. Valerie Castile, the mother of Philando Castile, recalled telling her son, "whatever you do when you get stopped by police, comply, comply, comply," as recounted in several news stories (July 8). Activist Alicia Garza, meanwhile, advised Twitter followers to "watch and document police activities" as one step in ending

police violence (July 13). In a sarcastic take on the issue, the *Huffington Post* issued two recommendations of its own: "don't be black" and "consider moving to another country" (July 7).

Articles and tweets, meanwhile, offered white readers advice on how to address racial bias, racism, and police-involved shootings. The *Huffington Post* offered general advice: "Be a part of the revolution and speak up" (July 8). Activist Alicia Garza urged white supporters to "understand that anti-Blackness is the fulcrum of white supremacy and teach others" (July 13). Some of the advice for white supporters hinted at the burden many black activists carry. On the day of Castile's shooting, activist Brittany Packnett tweeted a plea to her followers: "White folks need to help other white folks understand the pain today" (July 7).

Just as Valerie Castile urged her son to "comply, comply, comply" with officers' directions, other parents of black children discussed having "the talk" on police encounters with their children. Some articles offered advice on this discussion, while others gave parents and educators suggestions on how to address the subject of police violence with children and adolescents. These articles often also included expressions of fear for the safety and wellbeing of black children.

Subcategory: Calls to action

Units coded in this subcategory include a call to action to audiences. This subcategory included calls to action for specific groups, such as white or black people, or to people generally. It did not include advice offered to specific groups, unless that advice

included an imperative statement. Activists, celebrities, and others issued calls to action for all Americans or for specific groups. LeBron James, in a statement at the ESPY Awards, made this statement, which was quoted in several media outlets: "It's time to look in the mirror and ask ourselves, 'What are we doing to create change?'" (*The Root*, July 14). The St. Paul Federation of Teachers also issued a general call in their statement following Castile's death: "We can, and must, do better" (July 8). Some of the calls to action were more specific. Activist Brittany Packnett called on Twitter followers to join Campaign Zero, a police reform campaign organized by several prominent Black Lives Matter activists (July 7).

Category 4: EXPRESSIONS OF EMOTIONS

Units coded in this category include expressions of fear, anger, and other negative emotions following the death of Philando Castile. Many individuals – activists, public officials, celebrities, and others – expressed a range of emotions following Castile's death. The emotions were almost universally negative. While many people experienced typical emotions associated with grief, including sadness, shock, and fatigue, others expressed emotions of anger, frustration, or helplessness. Some also spoke of other emotions related to police violence, including fear or distrust of police. This category includes two subcategories (expressions of negative emotion and fear/distrust of police) and two codes (expressions of negative emotion and fear/distrust of police).

Subcategory: Expressions of negative emotion

Units coded in this subcategory referred to negative emotions that were expressed in response to Castile's death or police-involved shootings more generally. This subcategory included expressions of sadness, anger, frustration, fatigue, shock, grief, or other negative-valenced emotions in response to Castile's death or to other police-involved violence. It did not include expressions of fear of police. An article in the *Huffington Post* summarized the complexity of emotions that come after a death like Castile's: "In the moments just after tragedy, words can seem insufficient in expressing the shock, anger, and despair a person might feel" (July 7). Many celebrities and public officials were quoted in news articles and retweeted online attempting to speak to a collective grief. Then-California Attorney General Kamala Harris made the following statement: "I believe we are at a moment in this country where people are experiencing an incredible amount of pain" (*Breitbart*, July 14). That pain was reiterated and elaborated upon across the internet. At the same time, a *Huffington Post* article summarized the psychological effects of watching news accounts of police brutality, while another advised troubled observers on how to get a good night's rest despite the "stress and sleeplessness" caused by police-involved shootings (July 16). Perhaps the most wrenching accounts of emotional responses came from Castile's family and friends. Philando Castile's sister, Allysza, described to the *Washington Post* how cradled her mom as she cried herself to sleep: "I held her like a baby. I held her like she was my baby" (July 10).

Subcategory: Fear/distrust of police

Units coded in this subcategory referred to expressions of fear or distrust of police. This subcategory included references to feeling afraid or distrustful of police, either generally or in particular situations. It did not include expressions of other emotions such as grief or anger. While many activists, public officials, and writers for news organizations expressed negative emotions directly related to the Castile case, some also spoke about a general fear or distrust of police, either in themselves or in communities or neighborhoods. Parents expressed fear for their black children. In an essay for *The Root*, one mother described her fear of her children growing up, a "fear of them no longer being viewed as the adorable, innocent, silly children I know them to be, particularly by those in positions of authority" (July 19). Another woman described to the *Star-Tribune* how her neighborhood once had a good relationship with police officers, but now the relationship was characterized by separation. The St. Paul Police Federation accused Governor Mark Dayton of exacerbating that separation in some of his statements on Castile's shooting death: "The governor's comments cast judgment on law enforcement and deepen mistrust between officers and the communities they serve" (July 11).

Category 5: SOCIAL CRITIQUES

Units coded in this category offer observations on or proposals to reform the current state of race relations in the United States. Sources reacted to Castile's death by offering critiques of social disparities and race relations within the United States. These

critiques ranged from descriptions of measurable social disparities to a discussion of privilege and white supremacy. Many also took the opportunity to call for social unity or, in a few cases, social segregation with the establishment of a separate black nation. This category has two subcategories (racism & race-related issues and calls for change) and five codes (social disparities, Second Amendment and minorities, racial divisions, calls for unity, call for black nation).

Subcategory: Racism & race-related issues

Units coded in this subcategory discussed the larger role of race or race-related issues in society. This subcategory included references to economic, educational, or criminal justice disparities, including police violence, as well as to systemic issues, implicit bias, and differences in rights (such as the right to bear arms) that are based on race. It does not include any disparities that are not based on race or ethnicity. The discussion of race-related issues ranged from a general acknowledgement of social disparities based on race to case-specific examples of those disparities. In reaction to the deaths of Castile and Alton Sterling, Barack Obama said, "When incidents like this occur, there's a big chunk of our citizenry that feels as if, because of the color of their skin, they are not being treated the same" (*New York Times*, July 8). Specific disparities, such as in incarceration rates or income levels, were cited in several articles, as well as by public officials and activists.

Many blamed implicit and systemic biases as exacerbating factors in racial disparities. Several public officials, including New York Mayor Bill de Blasio and

presidential candidate Hillary Clinton, called for implicit bias training of police officers (*New York Times*, July 17). Others urged white people to consider the impact of implicit bias, systemic racism, and privilege on minorities.

In some cases, the idea of racial disparities was rejected, at least implicitly. One *Breitbart* article used sneer quotes to demonstrate the author's disdain: "The idea of 'systemic racism,' which has become a Hillary Clinton talking point, is an absurd contrivance that presumes all white people to be guilty, and is used to bully people – including liberals – into conformity with the radical left" (July 15).

Politicians and activists also referred to what they perceived as deep-seated racial divisions in the United States. Sometimes, sources perceived these divisions to be new occurrences. Several activists on Twitter rejected this idea, however. Chicago-based activist Ja'mal Green wrote: "The United States has never been United! We put on this amazing image around the world of who we are, but as a country we don't live up to it" (July 28). In response to claims that Black Lives Matter activists were exacerbating divisions, Alicia Garza wrote: "Man. This whole story about BLM setting race relations backwards. What exactly do y'all think has been happening since the 1700s?!" (July 25). Many also pointed to a system of white supremacy that increased division and disparities. According to an essay in *The Root*, "It is the height of white supremacy for one to tell an oppressed people that they must not only survive injustice but must also fix an evil system that they did not design" (July 19).

Many also weighed in specifically on race-related shootings by police officers. The word "epidemic" was employed multiple times to describe the problem, including

once by former NFL player Marcellus Wiley on his ESPN show, SportsNation (*Breitbart*, July 7).

One perceived disparity particular to Castile's case was highlighted by several activists through their Twitter accounts. According to Diamond Reynolds' account, Castile noted he had a gun and was licensed to carry, and this statement may have led the officer to shoot him. The *Huffington Post* quoted one observer as tweeting, "The fact that the NRA won't defend LICENSED gun carriers like #PhilandoCastile PROVES that 'right to bear arms' is only a WHITE PRIVILEGE" (July 8). Black Lives Matter activist Johnetta Elzie retweeted a story confirming that Castile had a concealed carry permit, with the message, "Your move, @NRA" (July 7). Activist Dominique Alexander similarly wrote, "Hey @NRA were are you now on fighting 4 justice 4 #PhilandoCastile he was a person exercising his 2nd amendment right o I forgot he is black [sic]" (July 7).

Subcategory: Calls for change

Units coded in this subcategory called for social changes to address the matter of police-involved killings of black people. This subcategory included calls for unity on policy or social unity, either across racial lines or within a racial group. This did not include calls for changes to police policy, but only for larger social changes. Amid discussions of racial divisions and social disparities, others took the opportunity to call for unity. NBA player Carmelo Anthony was quoted in the *New York Times* as saying, "While I don't have a solution, and I'm pretty sure a lot of people don't have a solution,

we need to come together more than anything at this time" (July 19). Many of the statements released by political leaders similarly called for people to come together.

One other response – which was much less frequently cited – was the call for a separate nation for black people. These responses appeared almost exclusively on the right-leaning news sites *Breitbart* and *The Daily Caller*. One *Daily Caller* article outlined a plan by "some black radicals" who were calling for the creation of black nation that would span five southern states (July 18). *Breitbart* noted an increase in black separatist groups since the increased attention on police-involved shootings (July 10). These calls for a black nation were not noted in the tweets of activists or in statements from official or elite sources.

Category 6: DISAPPROVAL

Another theme within the sample was criticism. Most frequently, this criticism was directed at police, but it also was directed at Black Lives Matter and at the media in general or certain media sources in particular. In general, criticisms of police came from left-leaning media sources and activists' twitter accounts, while criticisms of Black Lives Matter were found on right-leaning websites. Criticisms of both were also found in national and local news sources. Units coded in this category suggested disapproval of police, the Black Lives Matter movement, or the media in its coverage of Philando Castile's death or related issues. This category included three subcategories (criticism of Black Lives Matter, criticism of police, criticism of the media) and five codes (rejection

of Black Lives Matter, black militancy, police overreach, aggression toward police, and media criticism).

Subcategory: Criticism of Police

Units in this subcategory included criticisms of police, including criticisms of police methods and threats of violence directed at police in protest of those methods. It did not include descriptions of police methods or of actual violence against police. Criticisms directed at police ranged from descriptions of police overreach, including physical aggression and other infringements of individual rights, to outward aggression toward police, including threats and violence. Descriptions of physical aggression often came from the Twitter accounts of protesters who were tweeting live. The Black Lives Matter chapter in Minneapolis live-tweeted protests at the governor's mansion following Castile's death and documented several instances in which they felt police overreached. "We told y'all @sppdPIO maced children #govmansion #PhilandoCastile," read one tweet referencing the St. Paul Police Department (July 27). Other tweets documented what organizers perceived to be other rights infringements. Another tweet read, "of course they wouldn't, smh @sppdPIO walked all over your first amendment right to peacefully assemble, what a sham" (July 26).

Other individuals took their condemnation of police to another level, threatening or even committing violence against them. These actions were usually documented in news stories or in public statements rather than tweeted from activists' accounts. A *Pioneer Press* article recounted threats left on the St. Paul Police Department's Facebook

page, including one that read, “What happened in Dallas should have happened in your city” (July 17). *Breitbart* referenced social media posts from a Wisconsin man calling on black men to shoot white officers (July 10).

Acts of violence against police were also reported both in the news and in statements to the press. The shooting of police officers during a Black Lives Matter protest in Dallas was a topic that received widespread attention in the month after Castile’s death. Police officers were also injured during a Black Lives Matter protest in St. Paul, after protesters had shut down Interstate 94. The St. Paul Police public information office live-tweeted the protests, including specific descriptions of violence against officers and their injuries. “An officer was just hit in the face with bottle thrown by a protester on St. Paul street. #i94closed,” one tweet read (July 10). Another said, “We were just informed that the officer who had a concrete block dropped on his head during I-94 riot has broken vertebrae” (July 10). These protests and the injuries sustained by officers were also widely reported in the *Star-Tribune* and the *Pioneer Press*.

Subcategory: Criticism of Black Lives Matter

Units coded in this subcategory include criticisms of the goals or methods of Black Lives Matter activists or the Black Lives Matter movement. It also included threats against activists and the labeling of activists as “terrorists” or “militants.” It did not include references to black nationalism, descriptions of violence by protesters, or expressions of support of police. In the sample included in this study, criticisms of the Black Lives Matter organization and activists fell mainly in the press, although some

statements to the press also issued criticisms, particularly in the wake of the violent I-94 protests in St. Paul. A news story in the *Washington Post* recounted the repercussions faced by two police officers who posted criticisms of Black Lives Matter on their Facebook pages.

Some individuals, news outlets, and media personalities went even further than criticizing the organization. A *Breitbart* article described a petition on the White House website calling for the federal government to designate Black Lives Matter as a terrorist organization (July 11). Radio personality Rush Limbaugh similarly described activists as a "terrorist group" on his show, according to a *Huffington Post* article (July 8). Some articles also attempted to draw a connection between Dallas shooting Micah X. Johnson and the Black Lives Matter movement, although many prominent Black Lives Matter activists and organizations publicly denounced Johnson's actions.

Subcategory: Criticism of the Media

Units coded in this subcategory include criticism of the media generally or of specific media outlets for coverage of Castile's death or the Black Lives Matter movement. It did not include criticism of individuals who were quoted in the media. Criticism of the media was frequent, both by Twitter users and by left- and right-leaning news organizations. The *Huffington Post* called out a *New York Post* front-page headline that read "CIVIL WAR" in bold and capital letters (July 8). "The words might as well be 'RACE WAR,'" the writer opined. "It's a dangerous implication." Activist Patrisse Cullors, meanwhile, called out ABC News for cutting her off during a town hall meeting

with Barack Obama (July 14). The Police Officers' Federation of Minneapolis released a statement that offered more general critiques of the media, claiming that "false narratives…perpetuated by the media have driven our communities apart" (July 18). *Breitbart* and *The Daily Caller* also called out mainstream and left-leaning news organizations for their coverage of police-involved shootings, including Castile's.

Category 7: EXPRESSIONS OF SUPPORT

Units coded in this category offered expressions of or request for support for police or the Black Lives Matter movement. While many offered criticisms of Black Lives Matter and police departments, others offered expressions of support. Those expressions of support might be general expressions of cooperation (for example, when Minnesota Lynx WNBA players wore Black Lives Matter t-shirts before a game), or they may be tangible actions or requests for aid from supporters. These various actions were all considered expressions of support. This category included two subcategories (support for Black Lives Matter and support for police) and three codes (request for aid, support for Black Lives Matter, and support for police).

Subcategory: Support for Black Lives Matter

Units coded in this subcategory include expressions of support and requests for material aid (including for food, water, bail money, or extra protesters) for the Black Lives Matter movement. It did not include expressions of support or unity for Castile's family or friends, unless support was also expressed for Black Lives Matter. Expressions

of support for Black Lives Matter typically came from celebrities and public officials. Numerous articles, particularly on online-only news sites, documented the social media posts of actors, athletes, and other famous people who wrote impassioned pleas for police reform and unity. These statements often included explicit expressions of support for Black Lives Matter. In addition to celebrities' support, Black Lives Matter also received support from advocacy organizations and others. One article in *The Root* detailed the efforts of one Asian-American woman to increase support for Black Lives Matter among other Asian Americans (July 31).

Black Lives Matter activists also solicited support through Twitter. Movement leaders called on their followers to sign petitions, vote for or against political candidates, and provide tangible aid to protesters. Protesters in St. Paul tweeted using the local Black Lives Matter account to request everything from more protesters to food, water, and medical supplies. In one case, the account asked for video documentation of what the organization perceived to be excessive use of force by police: "Someone please start live streaming ASAP," the group wrote (July 26). Other messages solicited money to pay for bail money and legal costs for arrested protesters. Often, these messages requesting aid were retweeted by national activists, but they were rarely relayed in news articles. One exception was the request for bail money, which appeared both in local news stories and in online-only publications.

Subcategory: Support for Police

Units coded in this subcategory included expressions of support for police or police officers. It did not include references to police policy. News articles and official sources also frequently included messages of support for police officers, particularly following the Dallas police shooting. Following Castile's death, but before the Dallas shooting, Obama issued a statement praising police while also pushing for policing reforms (July 12). St. Paul Mayor Chris Coleman praised his city's police department for their work to "facilitate a peaceful protest in the capital city" (July 7). Although news accounts included fewer instances of celebrities expressing support for police, some were noted. Troy Aikman tweeted after the Dallas shooting, "Sadly most police departments around the country don't feel much support these days. #backtheblue" (*Huffington Post,* July 8). Although the media documented many expressions of sympathy from celebrities following the Dallas shootings, few included explicit expressions of support for police departments.

Sources

My third research question addressed the use of sources by various types of news outlets. I sought to understand whether news outlets quote activists or social media in their stories or whether they continue to use elite sources. Quantitative coding revealed that of all the articles (n=344) across the eight news sources, official/elite sources were most often quoted – 59 percent (n = 203) of all the news articles quoted or referenced elite sources of information. Activists were used less frequently than elite sources, in 20.6

percent (n = 71) of all news articles, while social media posts were mentioned or quoted in 23 percent (n = 79) of all news articles. (See table 2 for a complete accounting of the sources used.)

Elite sources were used by all media outlets, but were most often used in national print news articles, where 81.6 percent (n = 40) of coverage quoted elites. Left-leaning news organizations were least likely to quote elite sources – 40 percent (n = 37) of the total articles on these sites featured quotes from elites. Celebrity sources such as athletes and actors were quoted in 14 percent (n = 48) of all the news stories, most often in online articles. Roughly 22 percent (n = 44) of online news stories in the sample quoted celebrities, and this percentage was roughly even among left- and right-leaning news outlets.

Activists, meanwhile, were most likely to be used as sources in local print news – 35.8 percent (n = 34) of the news stories in the *Star-Tribune* and the *Pioneer Press* included quotes or information from activist sources. Surprisingly, the least likely news outlets to identify activists as sources were the left-leaning news online-only organizations such as the *Huffington Post* and *The Root*. Right-leaning news outlets quoted activists in 15.7 percent (n = 17) of articles, while national print news used activists as sources in 28.6 percent (n = 14) of their coverage.

Another difference is that news organizations used activists in different ways, depending on their organizational goals. The *Huffington Post* and *The Root* used activists as sources less frequently than other news organizations, but they also tended to write favorably about Black Lives Matter and related movements. On the other hand, while

Breitbart and *The Daily Caller* more often quoted activists, they did so in a different way than more moderate or left-leaning organizations. They rarely quoted activists directly, but got quotes from other media sources or Twitter. These quotes were often used as jumping-off points to deride or criticize the Black Lives Matter movement. For example, one *Daily Caller* article contrasted a statement from the Black Lives Matter network, which condemned violence against police officers with a chant employed a year earlier by protesters: "pigs in a blanket, fry 'em like bacon."

Social media was also used as a source. As suggested in the previous literature, Twitter continues to be the most common social media source – 13.7 percent of all articles referenced or directly quoted tweets. This included 18 percent (n = 36) of online articles and 5.5 percent (n = 11) of print articles. Facebook and Instagram were also used as sources in news articles, however. Facebook posts were quoted or referenced in 6.4 percent (n = 22) of all the articles, including 8 percent (n = 16) of online articles and 4.2 percent (n = 6) of print articles. Instagram posts were quoted or referenced in 5 percent (n = 10) of online articles; no instances of Instagram posts were found in print articles.

Table 2. Use of Sources at News Organizations

	Number (%) of Total Articles	Number (%) of Print Articles	Number (%) of Online Articles	Number (%) of Left-Leaning News	Number (%) of Right-Leaning News	Number (%) of National Print News	Number (%) of Local Print News
Referenced Tweets	47 (13.7%)	11 (5.5%)	36 (18%)	13 (14.1%)	23 (18.7%)	7 (14.3%)	4 (4.2%)
Referenced Facebook	22 (6.4%)	6 (4.2%)	16 (8.0%)	3 (3.2%)	13 (10.6%)	3 (6.1%)	3 (3.2%)
Referenced Instagram	10 (2.9%)	0 (0%)	10 (5.0%)	7 (7.6%)	3 (2.4%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
Activist Sources	71 (20.6%)	48 (33.3%)	23 (11.5%)	6 (6.5%)	17 (15.7%)	14 (28.6%)	34 (35.8%)
Official/Elite Sources	203 (59%)	106 (73.6%)	97 (48.5%)	37 (40%)	60 (55.6%)	40 (81.6%)	66 (69.5%)
Celebrity Sources	48 (14.0%)	4 (2.8%)	44 (22.0%)	20 (21.7%)	24 (22.2%)	2 (4.0%)	2 (2.1%)

First-Level Agenda Building

Although the newspapers and their sources touched on many of the same topics, the frequency with which issues were discussed varied depending on the source or newspaper type. Overall, the issues discussed most frequently in newspaper articles were police accountability (mentioned in 20.0 percent, n = 242, of cases), racial profiling (6.5 percent, n = 79), and other police reforms (6.0 percent, n = 73). Common topics discussed in news articles were police accountability (29.7 percent, n = 102, of news articles) and racial profiling (18.3 percent, n = 63). News organizations touched on the subject of police training in 7.8 percent (n = 27) of their articles, while their sources mentioned training less frequently. Elite sources mentioned training 1.7 percent (n = 4) of

the time, while activists mentioned it 1.1 percent (n = 7) of the time. However, news organizations less often discussed other police reforms (5.8 percent, n = 20) of articles). This category included many of the less common proposals of the Black Lives Matter movement, and activists mentioned other police reforms in 7.0 percent (n = 44) of their tweets. Elite sources, meanwhile, were most likely to discuss police accountability (19.0 percent, n = 45, of cases) and other police reforms (3.8 percent, n = 9), although these sources rarely delved into specific policy recommendations for reform. Activists also talked about police accountability and racial profiling, but many also offered policy recommendations that were not discussed frequently in the news or by elite sources. These included the use of body cameras and diversifying police forces, which received some attention in the news, but also other proposals such as ending excessive policing of minor crimes, limiting the use of force, and "demilitarizing" police forces. These latter proposals received almost no attention in the news outlets studied. (See Table 3 for a complete reporting of issues discussed by each information type.)

Table 3. Topics Mentioned in Activists' Tweets, Elite Subsidies, & New Articles				
	Number (%) of News Articles	Number (%) of Elite Subsidies	Number (%) of Activists' Tweets	Number (%) Total
Gun control	24 (7.0%)	3 (1.3%)	3 (0.5%)	30 (2.5%)
Police revenue	2 (0.6%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	2 (0.2%)
Body cameras	14 (4.1%)	1 (0.4%)	9 (1.4%)	24 (2.0%)
Open-Carry	39 (11.3%)	0 (0.0%)	2 (0.3%)	41 (3.4%)
Second Amendment	10 (2.9%)	0 (0.0%)	7 (1.1%)	17 (1.4%)
Community policing	24 (7.0%)	6 (2.5%)	0 (0%)	30 (2.5%)
Police reform (other)	20 (5.8%)	9 (3.8%)	44 (7.0%)	73 (6.0%)
Racial profiling	63 (18.3%)	4 (1.7%)	12 (1.9%)	79 (6.5%)
Diversifying police	5 (1.5%)	1 (0.4%)	4 (0.6%)	10 (0.8%)
Police training	27 (7.8%)	4 (1.7%)	7 (1.1%)	38 (3.1%)
Police accountability	102 (29.7%)	45 (19.0%)	95 (15.1%)	242 (20.0%)

This paper's fifth and sixth research questions asked whether a first-level agenda-building relationship existed between activists and news organizations. No strong, significant correlations were found between activists' tweets and newspaper articles, and in fact, many of the correlations were close to 0 (see Tables 4 and 5). Elite sources were only very weakly correlated with newspaper articles. The issues most strongly correlated between elite sources and newspaper articles were community policing ($\varrho = 0.127$, $p < 0.001$) and racial profiling ($\varrho = 0.114$, $p < 0.001$), although these correlations were still extremely weak. The correlations between liberal news sources and activists were also not significant or strong, and again, they often fell close to 0. Additional correlations were run to test relationships during shorter periods of time, including the five-day period from Castile's death through the initial protests (July 6-11) and the two-week period following Castile's death (July 6-20). Although these were periods of more intense activity, neither correlations between newspapers and activists, nor between newspapers

and elites, yielded significant or sizable correlations. These results indicate that while news organizations are to some extent quoting activists and using social media in their reporting, they are not significantly influenced to address the same policy concerns that activists voice online.

Table 4. Correlations Between Topics in Newspapers & Activists' Tweets (July 6-August 6)

	Spearman's rho	Significance Level
Gun control	-0.088	0.002
Police revenue	-0.025	0.383
Body cameras	-0.011	0.69
Open-Carry	-0.101	0
Second Amendment	0.002	0.955
Community policing	-0.127	0
Police reform (other)	0.049	0.089
Racial profiling	-0.114	0
Diversifying police	-0.009	0.761
Police training	-0.078	0.007
Police accountability	-0.093	0.001

Table 5. Correlations Between Topics in Newspapers & Elite Sources (July 6-August 6)

	Spearman's rho	Significance Level
Gun control	0.019	0.002
Police revenue	0.025	0.383
Body cameras	0.011	0.69
Open-Carry	0.101	0
Second Amendment	-0.002	0.955
Community policing	0.127	0
Police reform (other)	-0.049	0.089
Racial profiling	0.114	0
Diversifying police	0.009	0.761
Police training	0.078	0.007
Police accountability	0.093	0.001

Second-Level Agenda Building

Overall, the most commonly used frame was the problem/issue definition frame, which was used in 42.9 percent (n = 519) of cases across sources (see Table 6). The next most common were attribution of responsibility (used 17.1 percent of the time, n = 207) and human interest (14.2 percent of the time, n = 172). Within news articles, the most common frames were problem/issue definition (50.1 percent of articles, n = 169) followed by human interest (18.9 percent, n = 18.9) and conflict (18.0 percent, n = 62). Elite sources similarly used the problem/issue definition frame in 46.4 percent of communications, followed by the use of the human interest (17.3 percent, n = 41) and cooperation (13.9 percent, n = 33) frames. Activists were also more likely to use the problem/issue definition frame (used in 39.6 percent of tweets, n = 247), followed by attribution of responsibility (23.5 percent, n = 148) and cooperation (16.4 percent, n = 103). Despite the common perception that activists promote conflict, this frame was only used in 3.7 percent (n = 23) of their tweets.

The results indicate that no significant correlations exist between the frames employed by activists and the frames used by the mainstream media ($\varrho = 0.071$, $p = 0.01$). Elite sources similarly did not appear to have an influence in building the media's frames ($\varrho = -0.028$, $p = 0.330$).

Table 6. Frames Employed by All Sources				
	Number (%) of News Articles	Number (%) of Elite Sources	Number (%) of Activists' Tweets	Number (%) Total
Conflict	62 (18.0%)	10 (4.2%)	23 (3.7%)	95 (7.8%)
Cooperation (harmony)	16 (4.7%)	33 (13.9%)	103 (16.4%)	152 (12.6%)
Problem/Issue definition	169 (50.1%)	110 (46.4%)	247 (39.6%)	519 (42.9%)
Attribution of responsibility	21 (6.1%)	28 (11.8%)	148 (23.5%)	207 (17.1%)
Human interest	65 (18.9%)	41 (17.3%)	66 (10.5%)	172 (14.2%)
Morality	11 (3.2%)	15 (6.3%)	40 (6.4%)	66 (5.5%)

DISCUSSION

The central question of this paper is whether the concerns of activists on social media were reflected in news coverage of the death of Philando Castile. Evidence from this study is mixed as to whether reporters used activists' tweets as a primary source for information about Castile's death and police violence in general. On the one hand, a portion of news articles (20.6 percent) analyzed in this study did quote activists and use them as sources. On the other hand, correlation tests did not indicate that the policy and social issues that activists discussed were being covered in the news. This study's analysis suggests that while activists may be used as sources in news articles, their policy proposals appear to be ignored in coverage.

The reasons why journalists may ignore or underreport on activists' policies are various. According to Bennett (1996), journalists neglect social movements in favor of elites because of resource constraints, journalistic norms, and perceptions of the role of journalism. In particular, Bennett notes that to present a more authoritative view on a subject, a reporter may rely on official sources instead of grassroots or amateur

representatives, such as activists. Furthermore, research has demonstrated that on political matters, journalists tend to report on the politics – the so-called "horserace" – rather than policy issues (Nisbet, 2007). Although this study did not test this concept, it may also apply to coverage of Black Lives Matter movement and police-involved deaths. The news reports on these subjects may focus on the demonstrations and conflicts that follow the incident, rather than on substantive policy proposals to address the issues. This supports previous research that has found that media coverage of protests tends to focus on protests themselves, rather than the demands of the activists involved in them (Carragee, 1991; *Glasgow University Media Group, 1985*). In these cases, it is possible the media are gathering activists' responses to events such as shootings or protests instead of engaging in questions on policy or social issues. The findings of this study in combination with Bennett's early claims highlights the challenges activists face in advancing their policy concerns in the media. This is problematic in that activists are positioned as disruptors without having policy solutions which may make it more difficult for activist agendas to move into mainstream media and social discussion. This marginalization of activists and their issues of concern align with Gitlin's (1980) description of the ways in which the media delegitimized protest movements in the 1960s. This marginalization appears to continue to the present day, as this study demonstrates with the case of Philando Castile, and as other recent studies have demonstrated in the cases of the Tea Party and other modern activist movements (Weaver & Scacco, 2010; Tiffen et al., 2014).

Previous literature (Kreiss, 2014; Parmelee, 2013; Soo and Hadley, 2014) suggested that journalists may be turning to social media as a news source to mitigate resource and time constraints. While this may be the case (see below for more discussion on this), evidence from this study does not indicate that that national and online news organizations are using social media posts *from activists* to provide an alternative point of view to the same extent that they quote elite sources. The differences between the media coverage of Castile's death and the activists' tweets illustrated that reporters may still be relying on political elites for defining the scope of political discussion (Bennett, 1990). Although only weak correlations were found between elite sources and the news, this study found that elites were by far the most frequently quoted source type, appearing in 59 percent of all news articles in the sample. Other evidence also suggests that reporters are influenced by elites and by the legislative agendas established by elite and official sources. For example, the use of body cameras by police officers is one of the most popular proposals at the state and local levels (Levy, 2015). The adoption of body cameras is one of the most frequently cited solutions in news articles on Castile's death. Greater investment in police training is another issue that appeared frequently in newspaper articles, and it is also a key legislative proposal put forward in the Obama administration's Task Force on 21st Century Policing (2015). Meanwhile, many of the solutions activists put forward – such as defining police departments, ending the policing of minor crimes, and demilitarization of police forces – did not appear in news articles about Castile's death. All of this further supports the idea that journalists continue to rely

on elite and official sources of information, even in cases like police brutality that receive much attention from activists.

Interestingly, activists were most often quoted by local news reporters who had the chance to meet with local activists in person. Findings of this study indicated that activists were quoted less frequently in national print stories and online-only stories. One reason for this may be geographic constraints. While local reporters can easily visit protest sites and engage with activists, national and online reporters do not have the resources or geographic proximity to talk to activists as easily. Another reason local media may be more likely to interview activists is because, since the matter happened in their coverage area, they may be reporting on the issues in greater depth, allowing them more column inches to dedicate to details and interviews with activists. Whatever the reason, this may have implications for policy development in communities that have experienced incidences of police-involved violence. If activists have a stronger voice in the local media, they may also have a stronger voice in influencing policy, or at least in raising issues related to police violence. In addition, this finding hints at the possibility that local or statewide, rather than national, policy changes may be more readily advanced and inclusive of activist participation and engagement.

In some ways, the involvement of Black Lives Matter in Castile's case may have impacted the findings of this study. First, because the movement is so clearly tied to matters of race, this may have played a role in media coverage. Although race wasn't the primary focus of this study, previous research has indicated that black concerns are treated differently and their concerns are often dismissed within media coverage

(Entman, 1992; Winter, 2008; Heider, 2014). An examination of the role of race in media coverage of the Black Lives Matter movement may be warranted. Second, as mentioned in my review of the literature, the Black Lives Matter movement does not hold the same public support as other recent high-profile movements, such as Occupy Wall Street (Cooper, 2011; Horowitz & Livingston, 2016). This lower level of public support may be mirrored in how the media choose to cover cases such as Castile's. Finally, because the Black Lives Matter movement does not have strong central leadership or connections to prominent elites, this may give activists a disadvantage in communicating their message with journalists.

The continuing reliance on elite sources in reporting is a particular challenge to movements like Black Lives Matter, which seeks to reform the very institutions on which journalists continue to rely for information. This bias in sourcing may have impacts on readers' perceptions of the Black Lives Matter movement and anti-establishment movements in general. The mainstream media can be an important tool for effecting policy changes (Cobb and Elder, 1971), and without fair, accurate, and thorough representation in the media, political movements will find it difficult to get widespread support for their policy goals. The results of this study indicate that the media may continue to be a barrier for organizations like Black Lives Matter to achieve their political goals. The invisible barrier to inclusion in media coverage creates several challenges for activist organizations. First, until or unless the media more thoroughly reflects the concerns of activists, movements such as Black Lives Matter will struggle to build a legislative agenda that addresses their most pressing concerns. Second, the media begins

to have a univocal rather than a multivocal discussion about legislative policy. A univocal approach suggests that different groups have consented or agreed upon a particular policy approach when that may not be the case. Finally, a reliance on elite sources dismisses the concerns of marginalized groups which may be disproportionately affected by the policy changes advanced.

This study did find evidence to support previous research asserting that journalists are using social media as a source of information, even if they are not using these platforms to quote activists. This may indicate that journalists *are* using social media as a short-cut in their reporting, but that they are still relying on traditional sources, albeit on new platforms, for gathering information. Although this may not significantly change the information journalists receive from their sources, it does change the traditional understanding of how journalists collect and filter information. Instead of collecting information meant specifically for reporters, in the form of one-on-one interviews, press conferences, or press releases, they are turning to information that is meant for mass dissemination. The role of interpreting and filtering this information no longer falls solely on journalists, as anyone with a Twitter account can read, share, or respond to the information from public officials. As Hermida (2012) suggested, reporters appear to be increasingly using social media content in their reporting, even if the information is not created specifically for or distributed directly to the news media. This shift may require a new understanding of the news media's role in the digital media landscape. In addition, the following feature of Twitter extends the possibility of an elite-media echo chamber unless attention is paid to the sources present on a reporter's Twitter feed.

Intriguingly, the left-leaning online news organizations *Huffington Post* and *The Root* quoted activists the *least* in their coverage of Castile's death. One reason this may be the case is that many of the contributors to these outlets are activists themselves, as self-identified in their stories or author biographies. This factor was not measured in this study. However, the news coverage from these outlets still did not correlate with the issues discussed by activists on Twitter. These self-identified activists writing for the left-leaning organizations may simply have not been addressing policy issues. Indeed, many of the articles appearing on these sites are personal essays and not straightforward news stories. Alternatively, they may not be closely aligned with the leaders of the Black Lives Matter movement selected in this study for analysis. Whatever the case, these findings indicate that left-leaning news outlets, although perhaps more sympathetic to the Black Lives Matter movement, are not strongly influenced by the movement's leaders in their reporting on policy matters.

The findings of this study seem to contradict previous research on social media and agenda-building, which found that information from social media does play a role in shaping the media agenda. However, this research has focused on the social media use of elites, such as political candidates and the Obama administration (Kiousis et al., 2015; Kiousis et al., 2016a). The current study suggests that that same agenda-building relationship is not seen between other social media users (i.e., activists) and the media. Although social media allow marginalized groups to share information to wider audiences (Grossman, 2009), it does not appear to influence the way in which journalists covered the issues and policies related to the death of Philando Castile. Ultimately,

although the internet has changed the way in which journalists collect information, it has not changed the sources they use. It appears traditional assumptions of the relationship between the press and political elites (Bennett, 1990) remain relevant today.

The continuing reliance on elite sources by journalists has implications both for the reporters themselves and for news consumers. Journalists may wish to question their role in a U.S. democracy. Previous literature suggests that the media has long had the role of supporting the status quo and echoing the perspectives of political elites, while marginalizing viewpoints that fall outside the realm of official discourse (Bennett, 1990). If journalists seek instead to represent diverse perspectives on controversial issues, this study suggests they may be failing at that goal. Of course, this may be easier said than done. The norms of any profession, including journalism, are difficult to change. If, as Bennett (1996) suggests, journalists seek to establish their legitimacy by quoting sources they view as reliable, they may need to seriously consider how this bias toward legitimacy impacts their reporting.

The results of this study also suggest that consumers should understand the bias toward elite sources that prevails in the media, from legacy news organizations to newer, online-only publications. The marginalization of minority voices can impact the way that news consumers perceive movements such as Black Lives Matter. Responsible consumers should recognize this bias and take steps to further inform themselves of issues.

One final important finding in this paper relates to the different ways in which sources and news outlets framed Castile's death and the events that followed. While no

large, significant correlations were found in the use of frames by journalists and sources, the differences in the frames used may highlight challenges faced by those from all perspectives seeking solutions to police violence. In line with previous research (Bennett, 1996; Jamieson & Capella, 1998), this study found that news articles employed conflict frames heavily, and to a greater extent than their sources of information. Meanwhile, activists and elites more often employed the cooperation frame than the conflict frame. Previous research has indicated that the news media tends to reframe political issues in a way that emphasizes drama and conflict (Callaghan & Schnell, 2010; Karlberg, 1997). Because news outlets are using different frames than activists and official sources are, that suggests that journalists are taking their framing of events from elsewhere – or that they are constructing frames on their own. If journalists are reframing messages about police brutality and the Black Lives Matter movement, this presents new questions on why they are doing so. Although it is unlikely, as Gamson (1984) notes, that journalists intentionally frame the debate in certain ways, various norms, practices, and pressures may play a role in how they construct narratives. These norms, practices, and pressures, therefore, may have impacts on public opinion and policy.

The discrepancy in the use of frames presents challenges for the ability of different parties (for example, political leaders and activists) to resolve disputes over police policy. When these two groups are presented with a media-generated portrait of conflict, they may find it more difficult to engage with the other in substantive policy discussions. The public, meanwhile, may be led to believe that more conflict exists between the two parties than actually does. The framing of social movements can lead the

public to accept or reject a movement's goals (Brasted, 2005). Framing that negatively portrays the Black Lives Matter movement can make it more difficult for activists to receive widespread public support. Because of the media's reliance on elite sources over activists, a conflict frame may lead many audience members to accept the elite narrative over that of the Black Lives Matter movement. Because Black Lives Matter activists represent a portion of the American population that is underrepresented in politics and the construction of policy, any media mischaracterizations of the movement can perpetuate inequalities in the American political system.

The use of frames can be further examined by probing why elites and activists use cooperation frames more often than conflict frames. It is easier to explain the motivation for elites, who have a political incentive to maintain stability and encourage unity instead of provoking conflict. For activists, however, the question is more complicated. Many of the tweets that were coded for cooperation were directed at other members of the movement. The use of the frame makes sense in these circumstances, as supporter cohesion may help activist groups achieve their goals. But at other points, activists also asked for cooperation from people and organizations apart from their identified supporters. This indicates that activists may seek to work within the system, with allies and political leaders, to achieve their goals. Readers of news articles that focus on the conflicts between these groups may not recognize that many activists seek to work within the political system, rather than wholly disrupting it. This disconnect, once again, makes it more difficult for activists to gain the political power and support they need to influence the legislative agenda on matters of police brutality.

The use of conflict frames by news organizations lends credence to the assertion that the media contributes to partisanship and polarization within the political system (Mutz, 2006). It also supports the argument that the media perpetuates unflattering and inaccurate representations of minorities (Gilens, 1996). This misrepresentation, in turn, makes it more difficult for groups like Black Lives Matter to see public support, and thus legislative action, on their policy proposals.

Limitations & Future Research

This research has several limitations that present opportunities for future research on activist movements and agenda building. First, because this research focused on a specific case, that of the death of Philando Castile, it is impossible to make definitive generalizations about the findings. Castile's case presented some specific issues related to police-involved deaths, such as racial profiling and concealed-carry/open-carry gun laws. In many police-involved shootings that have generated controversy, the victim was not armed, making the issue of gun laws less relevant to police violence overall. At the same time, certain issues that often do come up in similar cases, such as stop-and-frisk and the use of police body cameras, were not directly applicable to this case. Therefore, other cases of police violence may yield different results.

Castile's case was also unique because it occurred during a week in which other incidents (the death of Alton Sterling and the killings of police officers in Dallas) also brought attention to police-involved shootings. This made it impossible to isolate information solely on Castile's death. Because much of the national media attention at

that time focused on Sterling's case, agenda-building effects related to Castile's case may not have been as strong. Future research on the agenda-building relationship between activists and the press should consider another case, either related to police violence or another, unrelated activist movement. The case of Michael Brown, which was followed by months of protests and helped elevate the Black Lives Matter movement, may show a more significant agenda-building relationship, for example (Fillion, 2014; Cobb, 2016; Sidner & Simon, 2015).

Another limitation of this study is that the sample was limited to print news sources. This was done to more easily compare news outlets, but it also makes it impossible to generalize these findings to all media types. Furthermore, the news outlets chosen for analysis are not directly comparable, limiting even the interpretations of the findings in this paper. The left-leaning and right-leaning news outlets, for example, offer different content to readers. While the more conservative *Breitbart* and *Daily Caller* offer spot news with some commentary, the more liberal *Huffington Post* and *The Root* have a strong focus on personal narratives and essays. This makes comparing source use between different types of media outlets difficult. Future research could focus on more alternative sources of media, as well as other types of outlets, such as YouTube news programs or less traditional blogs. Al Jazeera Plus utilizes a variety of social media channels for communicating stories to mostly younger audiences and may be on particular outlet to study (Roettgers, 2014). Alternative and community newspapers may also offer another perspective on cases of police involved shootings and should be considered in future agenda-building research on this subject.

The consideration of framing and reporting is limited by the news that is available at the time of data collection. As the news media continues to evolve with technology, reporting has become dynamic instead of static. The news articles used in this paper were the final, most updated versions, which often evolved over days of breaking news events. These articles are the end product and do not reflect the many changes journalists and editors made as the story of Castile's death broke. These changes, unfortunately, are now irretrievable. Previous iterations of the stories in the sample may have employed different frames or reported on other issues. Future research may consider the ways in which the framing of breaking news stories evolves over time. The real-time collection of articles during a breaking news event would allow for this comparison in the use of frames, reporting on issues, and use of sources, further increasing scholars' understanding of how journalists collect, process, and build breaking news stories. Broersma and Graham (2013) found that reporters use Twitter when government sources, such as politicians, are otherwise unavailable or to gather instant commentary on an issue. A study of the evolution of news articles may reveal that social media messages are used in earlier versions of a story, to be replaced later by official statements or quotes from in-person interviews.

One of this study's interesting findings was that, while Twitter is still the most frequently cited social media platform in news, it is not the only one. Facebook and Instagram posts were also referenced several times, indicating that future research on the use of social media as a journalistic source should incorporate more platforms to paint a fuller picture of the use of these platforms in newsgathering. Interviews could also reveal

more details on how and why journalists seek information on these sites. In-depth questioning could reveal which platforms journalists use in newsgathering, as well as how and why they select sources for inclusion in their stories. Although previous research has shown that journalists are using social media platforms in newsgathering, further studies could probe the question of how they select and vet sources both online and offline.

When considering the ways in which the media framed Castile's death and the subsequent protests, it is important to note aspects of the case that may have impacted the frames employed by journalists. The livestreaming of the aftermath of Castile's death limits the ways in which the media and public officials could frame the event by leaving many details unambiguous. We see, for example, that Castile was not holding a gun, which means he is unlikely to be portrayed as a threat or an aggressor. The news coverage of his death offered few, if any, suggestions that Castile was at fault for his own death. This makes Castile's case different from the deaths of other black men, including Michael Brown in Ferguson, Missouri, who was accused of robbing a convenience store prior to his death, or of Jamar Clark in Minneapolis, Minnesota, whom officers accused of physical aggression. Still, Castile's case may resemble others that were documented on video, such as the death of 12-year-old Tamir Rice, whose shooting was caught on a security camera, or the death of Walter Scott, which was captured by a bystander with a cell phone camera. Future research might consider a comparison of the news frames employed in cases with greater ambiguity and the news frames employed in cases captured, in part or whole, on video.

Finally, it is important to note that this study is not intended to demonstrate a causal agenda building relationship. As Riffe, Lacy, and Fico (2014) point out, we cannot establish causation without controlling for alternative explanations, nor without establishing time order. Since this study does neither of these, I merely seek to establish whether correlations exist.

The mixed results of this study highlight the need for future research on the subject of agenda building, particularly in cases involving race, protest movements, and police-involved shootings.

CONCLUSION

This study sought to determine whether, given changes in the media landscape, journalists were increasingly turning to activists' online posts to inform their reporting. Overall, the results of this study indicate that this is not happening. Although journalists do use social media to gather quotes and information, they continue to rely on official and elite sources in their reporting. This research supports long-standing theories on the relationship between the press and official actors (Bennett, 1990). Whether and to what extent this relationship will evolve with the internet is yet to be seen, but it is clear that elites continue to shape news coverage, at least on the subject of police brutality.

This study also offers contributions to the agenda-building literature. No evidence of agenda-building was found on the issue of police violence. This contradicts some previous literature that showed that social media played a strong role in building the media's agenda (Kiousis et al., 2016a). However, it is in line with other research that

indicated that social media had little effect (Kiousis et al., 2016b). These mixed results indicate that further research is needed. Because no significant agenda-building relationships were found, this study introduces new questions to this area of research on whether other actors play a role in building the media's agenda or whether agenda building exists only in certain contexts. Because this study examined a specific case and issue, rather than looking more broadly at political coverage, it is possible that the agenda-building relationships that have been demonstrated in previous literature do not exist in other contexts. This presents new questions for future researchers who examine agenda building in contexts beyond campaign coverage.

This study provided insight into agenda building and the use of sources in a new context, that of Philando Castile's death and its aftermath. Although no definitive evidence of agenda building was found, the results nonetheless contribute to our understanding of how journalists source information in the digital age. Further research on activists, social media, and the press will reveal may reveal more on this subject.

REFERENCES

1 arrested in Philando Castile protest in St. Paul. (2016, September 6). *Kare 11 News*. Retrieved from http://www.kare11.com/news/1-arrested-in-philando-castile-protest-in-st-paul/314722436

Adi, A. (2015). Occupy PR: An analysis of online media communications of Occupy Wall Street and Occupy London. *Public Relations Review*, *41*(4), 508-514.

Advertise on The Root. (2016, March 16). *The Root.* Retrieved from http://www.theroot.com/advertise-on-the-root-1790854632

Advertise with Us. (2017). *The Daily Caller.* Retrieved from http://dailycaller.com/advertise/

Alcindor, Y. (2016, 10 July). "DeRay Mckesson, Arrested While Protesting in Baton Rouge, Is Released." *The New York Times.* Retrieved from https://www.nytimes.com/2016/07/11/us/deray-mckesson-arrested-in-baton-rouge-protest.html?_r=0

Barry, E. (2009, April 7). Protests in Moldova Explode, With Help of Twitter. The New York Times. Retrieved from http://www.nytimes.com/2009/04/08/world/europe/08moldova.html

Baxter, G., & Marcella, R. (2012). Does Scotland 'like' this? Social media use by political parties and candidates in Scotland during the 2010 UK general election campaign. *Libri*, *62*(2), 109-124.

Beaumont, P. (2011, February 25). The truth about Twitter, Facebook and the uprisings in the Arab world. The Guardian. Retrieved from

https://www.theguardian.com/world/2011/feb/25/twitter-facebook-uprisings-arab-libya

Belair-Gagnon, V., Mishra, S., & Agur, C. (2014). Reconstructing the Indian public sphere: Newswork and social media in the Delhi gang rape case. *Journalism*, *15*(8), 1059-1075.

Bélair-Gagnon, V. (2013). Revisiting impartiality: Social media and journalism at the BBC. *Symbolic Interaction*, *36*(4), 478-492.

Bennett, W. L. (1990). Toward a theory of press-state relations in the United States. *Journal of Communication*, *40*(2), 103-127.

Bennett, W. L. (1996). The governing crisis: Media, money and marketing in American elections. New York: St. Martin's Press.

Bennett, W. L., & Segerberg, A. (2012). The logic of connective action: Digital media and the personalization of contentious politics. *Information, Communication & Society*, *15*(5), 739-768.

Berkowitz, D., & Adams, D. B. (1990). Information subsidy and agenda-building in local television news. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly*, *67*(4), 723-731.

Bernard, H. R., & Ryan, G. W. (2010). *Analyzing qualitative data: Systematic approaches.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Black Lives Matter group releases agenda ahead of presidential election. (2016, August 1). *CBS News*. Retrieved from http://www.cbsnews.com/news/black-lives-matter-group-releases-agenda-ahead-of-presidential-election/

Bond, S. (2015, May 21). "Univision buys African-American news site The Root". *Financial Times*. Retrieved from https://www.ft.com/content/920a0990-ffcf-11e4-bc30-00144feabdc0?mhq5j=e1

Brasted, M. (2005). Framing protest: The Chicago Tribune and the New York Times during the 1968 democratic convention. *Atlantic Journal of Communication*, *13*(1), 1-25.

Breed, W. (1955). Social control in the newsroom. *Social meanings of news: a text-reader*, *33*, 107.

Breitbart News hits record 240+ million pageviews, 37 million uniques in October. (2016, November 7). *Breitbart.* Retrieved from http://www.breitbart.com/big-journalism/2016/11/07/breitbart-news-hits-record-240-million-pageviews-37-million-uniques-in-october/

Brewer, M., & McCombs, M. (1996). Setting the community agenda. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly*, *73*(1), 7-16.

Broersma, M. & Graham, T. (2013). Twitter as a News Source, How Dutch and British Newspapers Used Tweets in Their News Coverage, 2007-2011. *Journalism Practice*, 7(4), 446-464.

Bromwich, J. E. (August 17, 2016). "What is Breitbart News?" *The New York Times.* Retrieved from https://www.nytimes.com/2016/08/18/business/media/what-is-breitbart-news.html?_r=0

Callaghan, K., & Schnell, F. (2001). Assessing the democratic debate: How the news media frame elite policy discourse. *Political Communication*, *18*(2), 183-213.

Callahan, Y. (2016, July 07). Social Media Reacts to Police Killing of #PhilandoCastile. *The Root*. Retrieved from http://thegrapevine.theroot.com/social-media-reacts-to-police-killing-of-philandocasti-1790888733

Capecchi, C., & Smith, M. (2016, November 16). "Officer Who Shot Philando Castile is Charged With Manslaughter." *The New York Times*. Retrieved from https://www.nytimes.com/2016/11/17/us/philando-castile-shooting-minnesota.html?_r=0 on June 29, 2017.

Carragee, K. M. (1991). " News and Ideology" An Analysis of Coverage of the West German Green Party by the New York Times. *Journalism and Communication Monographs*, *128*.

Chanen, D. (2016, July 9). Jesse Jackson visits Twin Cities as Castile shooting continues to reverberate. Star Tribune. Retrieved from http://www.startribune.com/ramsey-county-attorney-says-he-needs-time-to-determine-whether-to-use-grand-jury-in-castile-shooting/386029891/

Cobb, J. (2016). The Matter of Black Lives. *The New Yorker.*

Cobb, R. W., & Elder, C. D. (1971). The politics of agenda-building: An alternative perspective for modern democratic theory. *The Journal of Politics*, *33*(04), 892-915.

Cooper, M. (2011, October 19). "Poll: Most Americans Support Occupy Wall Street." *The Atlantic.* Retrieved from https://www.theatlantic.com/politics/archive/2011/10/poll-most-americans-support-occupy-wall-street/246963/

Day, E. (2015, July 19). #BlackLivesMatter: the birth of a new civil rights movement. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from https://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/jul/19/blacklivesmatter-birth-civil-rights-movement

Denham, B. E. (2010). Toward conceptual consistency in studies of agenda-building processes: A scholarly review. *The Review of Communication*, *10*(4), 306-323.

Downs, R. (2011, October 19). "'Forgotten' GOP Candidate Gary Johnson Expresses Support for 'Occupy Wall Street'". *The Christian Post*. Retrieved from http://www.christianpost.com/news/forgotten-gop-candidate-gary-johnson-expresses-support-for-occupy-wall-street-58711/

Edwards, G. C., & Wood, B. D. (1999). Who influences whom? The president, Congress, and the media. *American Political Science Review*, *93*(2), 327-344.

Entman, R. M. (1992). Blacks in the news: Television, modern racism and cultural change. *Journalism Quarterly*, *69*(2), 341-361.

Entman, R. M. (1993). Framing: Toward clarification of a fractured paradigm. *Journal of Communication*, *43*(4), 51-58.

Fernandez, M., Pérez-Peña, R., & Bromwich, J. E. (2016, July 8). Five Dallas Officers Were Killed as Payback, Police Chief Says. *The New York Times*. Retrieved November 15, 2016, from http://www.nytimes.com/2016/07/09/us/dallas-police-shooting.html

Fillion, R. M. (2014, November 24). How Ferguson Protesters Use Social Media to Organize. *The Wall Street Journal*. Retrieved from

http://blogs.wsj.com/dispatch/2014/11/24/how-ferguson-protesters-use-social-media-to-organize/

Fleming, A. (2011, September 27). Adbusters sparks Wall Street protest Vancouver-based activists behind street actions in the U.S. *The Vancouver Courier*. Retrieved from http://www.vancourier.com/news/adbusters-sparks-wall-street-protest-1.374299

Forliti, A. and Potter, K. (2016, July 14). "How Philando Castile told officer about gun was critical in his final moments." *St. Paul Pioneer Press.* Retrieved from http://www.twincities.com/2016/07/14/how-philando-castile-told-falcon-heights-police-about-gun-shooting-death/

Furber, M., & Pérez-Peña, R. (2016, July 7). After Philando Castile's Killing, Obama Calls Police Shootings 'an American Issue'. *New York Times*. Retrieved from https://www.nytimes.com/2016/07/08/us/philando-castile-falcon-heights-shooting.html

Gamson, W. A. (1984). *What's News: A Game Simulation of TV News: Participant's Manual*. Simon and Schuster.

Gandy, O. H. (1982). *Beyond agenda setting: Information subsidies and public policy*. Ablex Publishing Corporation.

Gans, H. J. (1979). *Deciding what's news: A study of CBS evening news, NBC nightly news, Newsweek, and Time*. Northwestern University Press.

General Ad Rates. (2017). *The Washington Post*. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-stat/ad/public/static/media_kit/16-2980-01-Gen.pdf

Gerbaudo, P. (2012). *Tweets and the streets: Social media and contemporary activism*. Pluto Press.

Gilberg, S., Eyal, C., McCombs, M., & Nicholas, D. (1980). The state of the union address and the press agenda. *Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly*, *57*(4), 584.

Gilens, M. (1996). Race and poverty in America public misperceptions and the American news media. *Public Opinion Quarterly*, *60*(4), 515-541.

Gilens, M., & Page, B. I. (2014). Testing theories of American politics: Elites, interest groups, and average citizens. *Perspectives on politics*, *12*(03), 564-581.

Girlfriend of Philando Castile gives emotional statement after fatal police shooting. (2016, July 7). *CBS News.* Retrieved from http://www.cbsnews.com/news/philando-castile-shooting-minnesota-diamond-reynolds-gives-emotional-statement/

Gitlin, T. (1980). *The whole world is watching: Mass media in the making & unmaking of the new left*. Univ of California Press.

Glasgow University Media Group. (1985). *War and peace news*. Philadelphia: Open University Press.

Goldsteen, R. L., Goldsteen, K., Swan, J. H., & Clemena, W. (2001). Harry and Louise and health care reform: Romancing public opinion. *Journal of Health Politics, Policy and Law*, *26*(6), 1325-1352.

Grossman, L. (2009, June 17). Iran Protests: Twitter, the Medium of the Movement. Time. Retrieved from http://content.time.com/time/world/article/0,8599,1905125,00.html

Gurman, S., & Foreman, S. (2016, July 9). "Cop's lawyer blames driver's gun, not his race". *Associated Press*. Retrieved from https://apnews.com/d6198b6cfc14472ca007d0339db21926/protest-over-minnesota-police-shooting-calm-constant

Hamdy, N., & Gomaa, E. H. (2012). Framing the Egyptian uprising in Arabic language newspapers and social media. *Journal of Communication*, *62*(2), 195-211.

Hänggli, R. (2012). Key factors in frame building: How strategic political actors shape news media coverage. *American Behavioral Scientist*, *56*(3), 300-317.

Harlow, S., & Johnson, T. J. (2011). The Arab Spring| overthrowing the protest paradigm? How the New York Times, Global Voices and Twitter covered the Egyptian Revolution. *International Journal of Communication*, *5*, 16.

Harris, F. C. (2015). “The Next Civil Rights Movement?” *Dissent Magazine*. Retrieved from https://www.dissentmagazine.org/article/black-lives-matter-new-civil-rights-movement-fredrick-harris

Hayes, A. F., & Krippendorff, K. (2007). Answering the call for a standard reliability measure for coding data. *Communication Methods and Measures*, *1*(1), 77-89.

Heider, D. (2014). *White news: Why local news programs don't cover people of color*. Routledge.

Hermida, A. (2012). Tweets and truth: Journalism as a discipline of collaborative verification. *Journalism Practice*, *6*(5-6), 659-668.

Heyes, Cressida. (2016, March 23). Identity Politics. *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Retrieved from https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/identity-politics/

Holpuch, A. (2015, December 23). Black Lives Matter protest shuts down Mall of America and airport terminal. *The Guardian*. Retrieved from https://www.theguardian.com/us-news/2015/dec/23/black-lives-matter-organizers-protest-mall-of-america

Holt, N. (2014, June 9). Six social search tools to help journalists find and analyze trends on Twitter. Retrieved from http://knightlab.northwestern.edu/2014/06/09/six-social-search-tools-to-help-journalists-find-and-analyze-trends-on-twitter/

Horner, S. and Melo, F. (2016, July 7). "Philando Castile remembered as warm, quiet, loved by students." *St. Paul Pioneer Press.* Retrieved from http://www.twincities.com/2016/07/07/philando-castile-falcon-heights-shooting-mn/

Horowitz, J. M. and Livingston G. (2016, July 8). "How Americans view the Black Lives Matter movement." *Pew Research Center.* Retrieved from http://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2016/07/08/how-americans-view-the-black-lives-matter-movement/

Hunter, D., & Polk, E. (2016). Academic Responses to Occupy Wall Street and Black Lives Matter. *Peace Review*, *28*(4), 444-450.

Jamieson, K. H., & Cappella, J. N. (1998). The role of the press in the health care reform debate of 1993–1994. In D. Graber, D. McQuail, & P. Norris (Eds.), The politics of news, the news of politics (pp. 110–131). Washington, DC: CQ Press.

Jones, J. M. (2015, June 19). "In U.S., Confidence in Police Lowest in 22 Years." *Gallup.* Retrieved from http://www.gallup.com/poll/183704/confidence-police-lowest-years.aspx

Karlberg, M. (1997). News and conflict: How adversarial news frames limit public understanding of environmental issues. *Alternatives Journal*, *23*(1), 22.

Kim, J. Y., & Kiousis, S. (2012). The role of affect in agenda building for public relations: Implications for public relations outcomes. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly*, *89*(4), 657-676.

Kiousis, S. (2005). Compelling arguments and attitude strength: Exploring the impact of second-level agenda setting on public opinion of presidential candidate images. *Harvard International Journal of Press/Politics*, *10*(2), 3-27.

Kiousis, S., Kim, J. Y., Kochhar, S. K., Lim, H. J., Park, J. M., & Im, J. S. (2016a). Agenda-building linkages between public relations and state news media during the 2010 Florida Senate Election. *Public Relations Review*, *42*(1), 240-242.

Kiousis, S., Kim, J. Y., Ragas, M., Wheat, G., Kochhar, S., Svensson, E., & Miles, M. (2015). Exploring new frontiers of agenda building during the 2012 US

presidential election pre-convention period: Examining linkages across three levels. *Journalism Studies*, *16*(3), 363-382.

Kiousis, S., Kim, S. Y., McDevitt, M., & Ostrowski, A. (2009). Competing for attention: Information subsidy influence in agenda building during election campaigns. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly*, *86*(3), 545-562.

Kiousis, S., Mitrook, M., Wu, X., & Seltzer, T. (2006). First-and second-level agenda-building and agenda-setting effects: Exploring the linkages among candidate news releases, media coverage, and public opinion during the 2002 Florida gubernatorial election. *Journal of Public Relations Research*, *18*(3), 265-285.

Kiousis, S., Ragas, M. W., Kim, J. Y., Schweickart, T., Neil, J., & Kochhar, S. (2016b). Presidential Agenda Building and Policymaking: Examining Linkages Across Three Levels. *International Journal of Strategic Communication*, *10*(1), 1-17.

Kleemans, M., Schaap, G., & Hermans, L. (2015). Citizen sources in the news: Above and beyond the vox pop?. *Journalism*, 1464884915620206.

Knoll, J. (2016, July 8). Thousands attend vigil, march for Philando Castile. *Kare 11 News*. Retrieved from http://www.kare11.com/news/philando-castile-vigils-underway/266780180

Kreiss, D. (2014), The Virtues of Participation without Power: Campaigns, Party Networks, and the Ends of Politics. *The Sociological Quarterly*, 55: 537–554. doi: 10.1111/tsq.12068

Krippendorff, K. (2004). *Content Analysis: An Introduction to Its Methodology*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE.

Larana, E. (1994). Identities, grievances, and new social movements. From *New social movements: From ideology to identity*, 3-35. Eds: Johnston, H., Larana, E., & Gusfield, J. R.

Lariscy, R. W., Avery, E. J., Sweetser, K. D., & Howes, P. (2009). An examination of the role of online social media in journalists' source mix. *Public Relations Review*, *35*(3), 314-316.

Lee, B., Lancendorfer, K. M., and Lee, K. J. (2005). Agenda-setting and the Internet: The intermedia influence of internet bulletin boards on newspaper coverage of the 2000 general election in South Korea. *Asian Journal of Communication 13*(1): 57-71.

Lee, F. L., & Chan, J. M. (2016). Digital media activities and mode of participation in a protest campaign: a study of the Umbrella Movement. *Information, Communication & Society*, *19*(1), 4-22.

Lee, J. C., Mykhyalyshyn, I., Omri, R., & Singhvi, A. (2016, July 16). At Least 88 Cities Have Had Protests in the Past 13 Days Over Police Killings of Blacks. New York Times. Retrieved from https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2016/07/16/us/protesting-police-shootings-of-blacks.html

Levy, G. (2015, May 5). Congress Left Behind in Rush for Police Reform. U.S. News & World Report. Retrieved from https://www.usnews.com/news/articles/2015/05/05/congress-left-behind-in-rush-for-police-reform

Lopez, R. (2016, July 17). “How Gov. Mark Dayton got to his big statement on race after Philando Castile was shot.” *Star Tribune.* Retrieved from http://www.startribune.com/how-dayton-got-to-his-statement-on-race-after-castile-was-shot/387094161/ on June 14, 2017.

Louwagie, P. and Van Berkel, J. (2016, July 15). “Thousands pay tribute to Castile: ‘His death is not in vain.’” *The Star Tribune.* Retrieved from http://www.startribune.com/castile-family-arriving-at-funeral-home-ahead-of-st-paul-cathedral-service/386800181/

Madhani, A. (2016, July 12). Days after police-involved shootings, protests continue. *USA Today*. Retrieved November 15, 2016, from http://www.usatoday.com/story/news/2016/07/11/police-involved-shootings-protests-continue/86971080/

Marchetti, R., & Ceccobelli, D. (2016). Twitter and Television in a Hybrid Media System: The 2013 Italian election campaign. *Journalism Practice*, *10*(5), 626-644.

Mathes, R., and Pfetsch, B. (1991). The role of the alternative press in the agenda-building process: Spill-over effects and media opinion leadership. *European Journal of Communication 6*: 33-62.

McCombs, M. (2014). *Setting the agenda: The mass media and public opinion*. John Wiley & Sons.

McCombs, M. E. (1992). Explorers and surveyors: Expanding strategies for agenda-setting research. *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly*, *69*(4), 813-824.

McCombs, M. E., & Shaw, D. L. (1972). The agenda-setting function of mass media. *Public Opinion Quarterly*, *36*(2), 176-187.

McCombs, M., & Reynolds, A. (2009). How the news shapes our civic agenda. *Media effects: Advances in theory and research*, 1-16.

Memoli, M. A. (2011, July 13). Obama news conference: Obama: Occupy Wall Street protests show Americans' frustration. *Los Angeles Times*. Retrieved from http://articles.latimes.com/2011/oct/06/news/la-pn-obama-occupy-wall-street-20111006

Meraz, S., & Papacharissi, Z. (2013). Networked gatekeeping and networked framing on# Egypt. *The international journal of press/politics*, *18*(2), 138-166.

Minneapolis NAACP chief demands release of video of Minnesota shooting. (2015, November 19). *Reuters*. Retrieved from http://www.reuters.com/article/us-minnesota-shooting-idUSKCN0T72HR20151119

Minneapolis Seeks Civil Rights Investigation into Police Shooting of Jamar Clark. (2015, November 17). *Associated Press*. Retrieved from http://www.nbcnews.com/news/us-news/minneapolis-seeks-civil-rights-investigation-police-shooting-jamar-clark-n464641

Mutz, D. C. (2006). How the mass media divide us. *Red and Blue Nation?: Characteristics and Causes of America's Polarized Politics*, 223-248.

Nelson, B. J. (1986). *Making an issue of child abuse: Political agenda setting for social problems*. University of Chicago Press.

Nelson, Tim (2015, December 4). Conflicting accounts: What happened the night Jamar Clark was shot? *MPR News*. Retrieved from https://www.mprnews.org/story/2015/12/04/jamarclark-shooting-what-happened

New York Times Company 10-K (PDF). (2017, February 22). *New York Post*. Retrieved from http://d18rn0p25nwr6d.cloudfront.net/CIK-0000071691/37d516f5-b9da-4ca8-a50f-d70630760094.pdf

Nisbet, M. C. (2007). Horse Race Coverage & the Political Spectacle. Retrieved from http://bigthink.com/age-of-engagement/horse-race-coverage-the-political-spectacle

Ordaz, L. V. (2015). Building the news media agenda: Spanish political parties' influence on traditional media and blogosphere agendas during the 2011 electoral campaign. *Communication & Society, 28(3)*, 115-134.

Owens, L. A. (2011, October 7). 40-year low in America's view of Wall Street. *CNN*. Retrieved from http://www.cnn.com/2011/10/07/opinion/owens-wall-street-disapproval/index.html

Papacharissi, Z. (2015). *Affective publics: Sentiment, technology, and politics*. Oxford University Press.

Parmelee, J. H. (2013). The agenda-building function of political tweets. *New Media & Society*, *16*(3), 434-450.

Paulussen, S., & Harder, R. A. (2014). Social media references in newspapers: Facebook, Twitter and YouTube as sources in newspaper journalism. *Journalism Practice*, *8*(5), 542-551.

Platform. *The Movement for Black Lives.* Retrieved from https://policy.m4bl.org/platform/

Prakash, N. (2016, July 7). "How Many More Must We Lose": Celebrities React to Alton Sterling, Philando Castile Shootings. Glamour. Retrieved from http://www.glamour.com/story/celeb-reactions-alton-sterling-philando-castile

President's Task Force on 21st Century Policing. (2015). Final Report of the President's Task Force on 21st Century Policing. Washington, DC: Force of Community Oriented Policing Services.

Properties. (2017). *Aol Advertising.* Retrieved from http://advertising.aol.com/properties#huffington-post

Reach. Response. Results. (2017). *St. Paul Pioneer Press*. Retrieved from http://extras.twincities.com/mediakit/

Riffe, D., Lacy, S., & Fico, F. (2014). *Analyzing media messages: Using quantitative content analysis in research*. New York, NY: Routledge.

Roettgers, J. (2014, February 28). Al Jazeera is staffing up for the launch of its AJ+ online video news network. *Gigaom.* Retrieved from https://gigaom.com/2014/02/28/al-jazeera-is-staffing-up-for-the-launch-of-its-aj-online-video-news-network/

Saldaña, J. (2015). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Sawyer, L. (2016, September 3). Protest results in brief closure of State Fair's main gate. *Star Tribune*. Retrieved from http://www.startribune.com/protesters-gather-at-site-where-castile-was-shot/392247781/

Semetko, H. A., & Valkenburg, P. M. (2000). Framing European politics: A content analysis of press and television news. *Journal of Communication*, *50*(2), 93-109.

Shapiro, T. R., Bever, L., Lowery, W., & Miller, M. E. (2016, July 9). Police group: Minn. governor 'exploited what was already a horrible and tragic situation'. Washington Post. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/morning-mix/wp/2016/07/07/minn-cop-fatally-shoots-man-during-traffic-stop-aftermath-broadcast-on-facebook/

Shoemaker, P., & Reese, S. D. (1996). *Mediating the message*. New York: Routledge.

Sidner, S., & Simon, M. (2015, December 28). He rise of Black Lives Matter: Trying to break the cycle of violence and silence. CNN. Retrieved March 11, 2017, from http://www.cnn.com/2015/12/28/us/black-lives-matter-evolution/

Silverman, C. (30 July 2012). "How journalists verify user-generated content, information on social media." *Poynter.* Retrieved from http://www.poynter.org/2012/how-journalists-verify-user-generated-content-information-on-social-media/182433/

Solutions. *Campaign Zero.* Retrieved from https://www.joincampaignzero.org/solutions/#solutionsoverview

Soo, J.M. & Hadley, P. (2014) Routinizing a New Technology in the Newsroom: Twitter as a News Source in Mainstream Media. *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media*, 58(2), 289-305.

Spearman, C. (1904). The proof and measurement of association between two things. *The American Journal of Psychology*, *15*(1), 72-101.

Stassen-Berger, R. E. (2016, July 8). Despite criticism, Mark Dayton stands by comments on Philando Castile shooting. *St. Paul Pioneer Press*. Retrieved from http://www.twincities.com/2016/07/08/despite-criticism-mark-dayton-stands-by-comments-that-race-a-factor-in-philando-castile-shooting/

Stelter, B. (7 July 2016). Philando Castile and the Power of Facebook Live. *CNN.* Retrieved from http://money.cnn.com/2016/07/07/media/facebook-live-streaming-police-shooting/index.html

Supadhiloke, B. (2012). Framing the Sino–US–Thai relations in the post-global economic crisis. *Public Relations Review*, *38*(5), 665-675.

Tarrow, S. (1994). *Power in movement: Social movements, collective action and politics.* New York: Cambridge University Press.

The *New York Times* Media Kit. (2017). *The New York Times*. Retrieved from http://nytmediakit.com/digital

The *Star Tribune* Media Kit. (2017). *The Star Tribune*. Retrieved from http://www.startribunecompany.com/mediakit/audiences.php#business-prof

Tiffen, R., Jones, P. K., Rowe, D., Aalberg, T., Coen, S., Curran, J., & Rojas, H. (2014). Sources in the news: A comparative study. *Journalism Studies*, *15*(4), 374-391.

Top 10 Minnesota Daily Newspapers. (2015, October 21). Retrieved from http://www.cision.com/us/2015/10/top-10-minnesota-daily-newspapers/

Tracy, S. J. (2012). *Qualitative research methods: Collecting evidence, crafting analysis, communicating impact*. John Wiley & Sons.

Tuchman, G. (1978). Making news: A study in the construction of reality. New York: Free Press.

Veenstra. A.S., Iyer, N., Hossain, M.D. & Park, J. (2013). Time, Place, Technology: Twitter as an Information Source in the Wisconsin Labor Protests. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 31 (65-72).

Walsh, P. (2016, July 10). Anger, dismay and nation's attention after violent I-94 shutdown. Star Tribune. Retrieved from http://www.startribune.com/about-100-arrested-in-st-paul-protests/386197981/

Walsh, P., & Jany, L. (2015, November 15). Anger builds after police shoot assault suspect in Minneapolis. *The Star-Tribune*. Retrieved from http://www.startribune.com/police-officer-shoots-north-minneapolis-assault-suspect-during-physical-struggle/349730171/

Wanta, W., Stephenson, M. A., Turk, J. V., & McCombs, M. E. (1989). How president's state of union talk influenced news media agendas. *Journalism Quarterly*, *66*(3), 537-541.

Weaver, D. A., & Scacco, J. M. (2013). Revisiting the protest paradigm: The tea party as filtered through prime-time cable news. *The International Journal of Press/Politics*, *18*(1), 61-84.

Weaver, D. H., & Choi, J. The Media Agenda: Who (or what) sets it? In *The Oxford Handbook of Political Communication*.

Weigel, D. (2016, July 12). "Three words that Republicans wrestle with: 'Black Lives Matter'." *Washington Post.* Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/three-words-that-republicans-wrestle-with-black-lives-matter/2016/07/12/f5a9dfdc-4878-11e6-90a8-fb84201e0645_story.html?utm_term=.5231ed950dfe

Weitkamp, E., & Eidsvaag, T. (2014). Agenda Building In Media Coverage of Food Research: Superfoods coverage in UK national newspapers. *Journalism Practice*, *8*(6), 871-886.

What we know about Philando Castile. (2016, July 7). *Star Tribune*. Retrieved from http://www.startribune.com/what-we-know-about-philando-castile/385853331/

What we know about the death of Jamar Clark. (2016, March 30). *The Star Tribune.* Retrieved from http://www.startribune.com/what-we-know-about-the-death-of-jamar-clark/353199331/

Winter, N. J. (2008). *Dangerous frames: How ideas about race and gender shape public opinion*. University of Chicago Press.

Young, Iris Marion. *Inclusion and democracy*. Oxford University Press, 2002.

Zamora, K. (2016, August 29). Philando Castile vigil briefly halts traffic near State Fair. *Star Tribune*. Retrieved November 15, 2016, from http://www.startribune.com/philando-castile-vigil-planned-outside-state-fair-on-monday-night/391615861/

Zhou, Y. & Moy, P. (2007). Parsing Framing Processes: The Interplay Between Online Public Opinion and Media Coverage. *Journal of Communication*, 57, 79-98.

APPENDIX A: FIRST-CYCLE CODEBOOK

Code name	Code description	Conditions of code	Exceptions to code	Typical examples of code	Atypical examples of code	Non-examples of code
Description of case	Code this if unit describes facts of Philando Castile's case.	• Includes any fact-based statements about Castile's shooting and death or Reynolds' recording of the event.	• Does not include description of other cases of police violence (i.e., Alton Sterling). • Does not include descriptions of protests. • Does not include characterizations of Castile or expressions of emotion.	• "In a short statement, the medical examiner said Mr. Castile sustained multiple gunshot wounds and died at 9:37 p.m. in a hospital emergency room, about 20 minutes after he was shot." (NYT01)		
Description of protests	Code this if unit describes facts of protests after Castile's death.	• Can be in reference to protests that occurred, or to plans/discussions of protest to occur in the future. • Only includes fact-based	• Does NOT include descriptions of Castile's death or expressions of emotions (grief, anger, etc.).	• PP20 • PP04 – costs associated with protests • "As much of the nation on Thursday focused on Cleveland for the final night of the Republican National		

		statements or descriptions.		Convention, protesters with the Movement for Black Lives - often referred to as Black Lives Matter - took to the streets in more than two dozen cities, one of the largest acts of joint protest in the movement's two-year history." (WP30) • "Protesters are dispersing after a peaceful assembly." (ES03) • "there shooting rubber bullets at us on grand Ave #PhilandoCastile" (AI06-4 – Mica Grimm tweeting at protest)		
"murder" or "murdered"	Code this if unit uses "murder" or "murdered" to describe Castile's death or the death of another black person by police.	• Unit MUST include some variation of the word "murder" in reference to the death of an individual at the hands of police.	• Do NOT include any other terms (like "killed" or "shot"). • Do NOT use if the term is used derisively,	• Michael B. Jordan: "Black people are being disproportionately dehumanized and murdered." (HP060)	"I didn't do it for pity, I didn't do it for fame. I did it so that the world knows that these police are not here to protect and serve us. They are here to	Reference to victims of Dallas shooting, or other references to killings that are not of a black person by police.

		• May use "murderer" to describe police officer. • May also use words "assassinate," "assassinated," or "executed"	sarcastically, or in "sneer quotes". • Do NOT code for term "homicide" (because legal definitions vary)	• "Who do we call when the murderer wears a badge? We call upon each other. Make your voice heard." (HP011 – also code for "call to action")	assassinate us. They are here to kill us. Because we are black." (Diamond Reynolds, TR05)	
Cooperation between protesters & police	Code this if unit discusses any cooperation between protesters, activists, and police.	• May include cooperative discussions or the rendering of aid.	• Does not include expressions of support or calls for unity.	• "St. Paul Commander Steve Anderson came down the street to meet with protest organizers, offering to help facilitate a move by securing the route and aiding with logistics." (PP40)		
Humanizing victim	Code this if unit humanizes Castile through quotes or descriptions.	• This may include quotes from friends, family, students, or parents of students with whom Castile worked. • May also include descriptions of Castile's life and background	• Does not include humanization of other victims of police violence.	"Danny Givens, a nondemoninational pastor who said he was a friend of Mr. Castile's, said, "Philando was a very even-keeled man, good-hearted, personable, smile would light up a room, eyes that just speak		

		that go beyond basic facts. • May include anecdotes about Castile's life.		volumes of love."" (NYT01) "When Allysza Castile heard her brother's voice for the last time, they were making plans on the phone to celebrate his upcoming birthday at Valleyfair, a local amusement park, with cotton candy, funnel cakes and roller coasters." (WP01) "Colleagues describe him as a team player who maintained great relationships with staff and students alike. He had a cheerful disposition and his colleagues enjoyed working with him. He was quick to greet former coworkers with a smile and hug." (ES-113)		

Humanizing perpetrator	Code this if unit humanizes Yanez through quotes or descriptions.	• This may include quotes from Yanez's friends, family, or coworkers. • May also include descriptions of Yanez's life and background that go beyond basic facts. • May include anecdotes about Yanez's life.	• Does not include humanization of other officers, including the other officer present at the scene.	The incident shocked Jeff Bumgarner, a former department chair at Minnesota State who taught Yanez in classes on policing. Bumgarner, who teaches at North Dakota State University, said Yanez was admired by his classmates and professors for his "servant's heart." (WP05) "In the years since graduating, he [Yanez] had posted online about a wedding and the birth of a child and settled into a suburban neighborhood." (NYT08)		Thomas Kelly, an attorney representing Yanez, said that the officer had left town to be with his wife and child. Kelly said Yanez, who is Hispanic, "is not a racist, and this incident had nothing to do with race and had everything to do with the presence of a gun, and the presence of that gun, permitted or not, was what led to the driver being shot." (WP05)
Reference to death of Alton Sterling	Code this if unit refers to Alton Sterling's death and/or aftermath.	• This includes any reference to Alton Sterling.	• Does not include references to any other cases.	• Any reference to the shooting of Alton Sterling may be included. The Sterling and Castile cases are		

				often mentioned simultaneously because they happened on two consecutive days.		
Reference to Dallas shootings	Code this if unit refers to the Dallas police shootings and/or their aftermath.	• This includes any reference to the Dallas police shootings	• Does not include references to any other cases.	• Any reference to the July 2016 shootings of police officers in Dallas be included.		
Reference to others	Code this if unit refers to death or injury of other minorities by police officers.	• Includes any reference to the death or injury of a minority besides Sterling or Castile by police officer. • Includes cases in which evidence is inconclusive or guilt has not been established.	• Does not include references to cases of Castile or Sterling.	• References to deaths of Jamar Clark, Trayvon Martin, Sandra Bland, Michael Brown, etc.	• Reference to the death of Korryn Gaines, who didn't pop up in media stories but was mentioned by activists on their Twitter feeds. (Dominique Alexander, AI-6; Rashad Turner, AI09-1) • References to Paul O'Neal, who was also killed after Philando Castile. (Samuel Sinyangwe, AI10-22)	

Reference to gun violence	Code this if unit refers to other cases of gun violence that are not committed by police officers.	• May be a general or specific reference to gun violence or mass shootings.	• Does NOT include references to police-involved shootings.	• References to terrorist attacks, Sandy Hook shooting, Orlando nightclub shooting		Our hearts are with the families of the dead in #Nice. Love, light, and healing to you. (IS002) – truck attack (not gun attack)
Compariso n to white cases	Code this if unit refers to case of white criminals.	• Reference to or description of a case involving a white criminal, IF used to compare different treatment of white and black people by law enforcement.	• Does NOT include descriptions of cases involving white suspects if case is not used to illustrate differences in treatment based on race.	• Reference to Dylan Roof's arrest, in which no one was injured.		
Gun control	Code this if unit references calls for or against gun control legislation.	• Includes calls for increased gun control • Can be specific proposals or general calls •	• Do NOT include references to gun violence. • Do NOT include references to racial disparities in gun rights.	• "Last month's massacre in Orlando was the driving force behind the latest round of gun-control battles in Congress. Democrats." (WP25) • "During a Friday press conference, Attorney General Loretta Lynch expressed		• References to Castile's 2nd Amendment rights being violated (code for racial disparities in 2nd amendment rights)

				condolences over the July 7 attack on Dallas police officers and suggested it is time to re-examine 'the ease with which wrongdoers can get their hands on deadly weapons.'" (BB025)		
Police revenue	Code this if unit references police revenue through traffic stops or other minor traffic offenses.	• May include discussions of traffic stops as a form of revenue.	• This does NOT include references to funding from taxpayer money or general references to police revenue streams.	•		
Racial profiling	Code this if unit refers to racial profiling by police.	• This refers to racial profiling in traffic stops – the idea that minorities are pulled over at higher rates than white people.	• Do NOT code for references to implicit bias	• Rep. Elijah Cummings "said he's been pulled over '50 million times' for no clear reason, and it's all connected to people of color being targeted by law enforcement." (HP061) •	"update: it appears #PhilandoCastile was a black man in America (of course he's been pulled over)" w/link to article about Castile's traffic stops (AI06-13, Mica Grimm tweet)	• Reference to reporting that Castile was pulled over because he matched the description of a robbery suspect (UNLESS unit explicitly connects this with profiling).

Open-carry	Code this if unit references open-carry laws.	• This may include specific description of Castile's case (MN is open-carry state) or more general references to open-carry laws. • May also include reference to concealed weapons.	• Do NOT code for references to illegal gun possession. • Do NOT code for references to law enforcement's use or possession of weapons.	• "Your move, @NRA. #PhilandoCastile [POSTED WITH RETWEETED MESSAGE:] Police sources: Philando Castile - man shot by police officer - did indeed have a concealed carry permit with @Hennepin @kare11" (AI05; also code for "Second Amendment and minorities")		
Privatizing police	Code this if unit discusses or calls for the privatization of policing.	• Unit may discuss privatization of police force or the use of private security to combat problems of police accountability or race-based police violence.	• Does NOT include other proposed changes to the police force, for example changes in funding.	• One Daily Caller article argued that Black Lives Matter should push for the privatization of police as a way to increase police accountability, citing examples of cases in which private security were immediately disciplined for		

				violent actions. (DC14)		
Body cameras	Code this if unit references use of or call for use of body cameras by police officers.	• Includes both reference to body camera policies AND descriptions of specific cases in which body cameras were or were not used.	• Do NOT code for use of other cameras (for example, witnesses' use of recording devices)	• Some activists advocate for the use of body cameras to hold police more accountable.		
Communit y policing	Code this if unit references community policing efforts or policies.	• This may refer to community policing already in place, or to calls for or arguments against community policing.	• Do NOT code for other forms of policing or training (for example, implicit bias training).	• NYT38: Describes Dallas police chief David O. Brown's initiatives to increase community policing. • Statement by John J. Choi, Ramsey County Attorney: "We must do better, in our state and in our nation, to improve police/community interactions to ensure the safety of everyone in this country, but		

				particularly the safety of African Americans, who disproportionately lose their lives as a result." (ES10) •		
Police accountability	Code this if unit includes call for increased police accountability, or discusses police accountability, in use-of-force cases.	• Includes calls for accountability in Castile's case or generally • May be calling for accountability of single perpetrator, or the police as a whole. • May also include statistics or descriptions to illustrate current state of accountability.	• Does NOT include calls for greater/different training.	• Looking at every complaint filed against Chicago police between Jan. 1, 2011, and Dec. 7, 2015, researchers found that more than half of the officers received fewer than one complaint a year. By contrast, the worst 1 percent of officers generated about 25 percent of the complaints. (TR50) • Indict convict send killer kkkkops to jail the whole damn system is guilty as hell #PhilandoCastile (IS004) • "In her first	• "And until the court system works, there can't be no peace." (BB070) – failure of courts to hold police accountable • Statements on the need to hold officer(s) accountable, or on the investigation: "The Minnesota Department of Public Safety Bureau of Criminal Apprehension (BCA) is conducting an independent investigation into the incident." (ES02	

				interview with media following the shooting, Reynolds lambasted the way the police treated her and her daughter following the shooting. 'He (Yanez) should not be home with his family. He should be somewhere in jail, handcuffed.'" (DC02) • References to attaining "justice" for victim(s). • Calls for or references to investigations into police officers or departments. (BB008, BB010) • "Superintendent Eddie Johnson has stripped officers in all of the police shooting cases. I respect that! That's sending a signal." (AI04)	– BCA press release)	

				• "What I can't forget about the video of #PhilandoCastile is the officers reaction after. 'You made me do this!' No accountability" (AI05) •		
Diversifying police	Code this if unit calls for diversification of police force.	• This may refer to any call for greater diversity on police forces.	• Do NOT code for references to implicit bias, racial profiling, or diversity training.	• "Activists have called for diversifying America's predominantly white police force." (HP063) • Amy Klobuchar, in a statement, called for "diversity in hiring" as one of many proposals to improve accountability and trust (ES-104).		
Police training	Code this if unit describes how police are trained, or if it includes calls for changes to police training.	• This may refer to any call for more or different police training • Any reference to "implicit	• Does NOT refer to increased accountability, changes in funding, or other police reforms.	• Description of Officer Yanez's "Bulletproof Warrior" training • Calls for use-of-force trainings	"#DeescalateDontKill makes sense when cops walk into a hostile situation." (AI02-3, Brittany Packnett)	

		bias" training may also be coded for "implicit bias."		• Clinton: "She vowed to fight "systemic racism" in police departments and to better train law enforcement officials and integrate them into the communities they serve." (NYT20 – also code for "systemic racism") • Six years ago, a lawsuit settlement put aside more than $1.5 million for training to help police avoid racially charged incidents like the recent shooting death of Philando Castile. (PP15)	"Hey Mr. Choi, Philando Castile was killed because the officer didn't Follow his training." (AI09-2, Rashad Turner)	
Police reform (other)	Code this if unit calls for (or pushes against) police reform that cannot be coded otherwise.	• This may be a general call for (or argument against) police reform or may reference other specific initiatives or	• Do NOT code for references to specific reforms that fall under another code – community policing, accountability	• "'Reform of the current system will not suffice,' she (Opal Tometi) said. 'We must transform it.'" (HP081) • "The protest was one of several	"'No more reforms! No more waiting until tomorrow! No more empty statements from politicians!' yelled Dubian Ade, another participant	"What is Mr. de Blasio -- who oversees the largest police force in the country, one he believes can serve as a national model for reform -- doing about this? His

		proposals for police reform.		nationwide over the deaths of Alton Sterling in Louisiana and Philando Castile in Minnesota that have prompted Obama to make an emotional appeal for urgent police reform." (BB110) • "The laws that govern when police can use lethal force need to be reformed and they need to be reformed now. International law is clear that lethal force must only be used as a last resort against an imminent threat of death or serious injury." (Jamira Birley, campaign manager for Amnesty International USA, in statement – ES15) • "Ending police violence requires	at the rainy Friday protest." (DC25) Calling for abolition of policing (AI01-18) or defunding (AI08-15): "this is why we need to #Defund the police" (Patrisse Cullors, response to ruling on killing of Redel Jones) Many protesters call for defunding police or abolishing policing, which many noted did not serve them anyway. Alicia Garza noted in one post that when people in her community call, the police don't come, so they solve problems themselves. Implied call for reform: "There's no national standard 4 emotional wellness of police officers. That means sociopaths can be	record fighting for greater accountability and transparency so far leaves us wondering." (NYT45) –code for accountability

				changing policies that govern police behavior and imposing immediate limits the role of police…It requires establishing empowered civilian oversight structures that are accountable to the public…It requires establishing restrictive use of force policies and ending policing of 'broken windows' offenses that led to #KorrynGaines death." (Samuel Singyangwe, AI11-10 to AI11-12)	police" (AI01-21, Alicia Garza) "Let's make this plain: Nothing short of divesting from 'policing' can solve this crisis." (AI07-19, Opal Tometi)	
Advice for black people	Code this if unit refers to advice offered to black people in dealing with police.	• Includes any advice (from a person/people or organization) offered to black people about how to act in the presence of law enforcement.	• Do NOT code if it offers other advice (for example, how to manage news-related stress). • Do NOT code if it offers advice	• Black country singer Coffey Anderson posting YouTube video on how black people should act when pulled over by police (HP057).		• Advice from HuffPo: "Don't be black" and "Consider moving to another country" (HP079) • Advice for protesters: Folks,

			sarcastically or satirically. • Does NOT include discussions of parents educating black children on how to act around law enforcement.	• Valerie Castile: "I know my son … we know black people have been killed … I always told them, whatever you do when you get stopped by police, comply, comply, comply." (BB001) • Alicia Garza (AI01-11): "Watch and document police activity. Demand a re-routing of resources to community needs." – in response to question on how people can work in communities to end police violence		be careful what you are saying as you walk. Walk in pairs and groups. White people, walk with POC to add level of protection, please. (IS001) – this is out of concern for counterprotesters, not police
Advice for white people	Code this if unit refers to advice offered to white people in addressing racial bias, racism, or police-involved shootings.	• Includes any advice offered to white people (by other people or organizations) on how to address racial	• Does NOT include other advice offered to white people (for example, on how to respond to law enforcement).	• "Here's what white people who consider themselves allies should know moving forward: … Be a part of the revolution and		

		bias, racism, or police-involved shootings of minorities.		speak up. (etc.) (article text, HP074) • "White folks need to help other white folks understand the pain today." (AI02-5, Brittany Packnett) • "Understand that anti-Blackness is the fulcrum of white supremacy and teach others" (Alicia Garza, AI01-12)		
Advice for parents/educators	Code this for references to advice for parents who want to talk to their kids about police-involved shootings.	• May include advice for either white or minority parents. • Must specifically reference children.	• Does NOT include advice offered to adults or to general populations that may include children.	• "After watching the video of (Alton) Sterling, one of my black high school friends role-played with his sons, ages 8 and 12, on how to respond if they are ever confronted by a police officer." (article text, HP058) • Steven Berkowitz, an associate professor of clinical psychiatry		

				at the University of Pennsylvania, said schools should deliver one simple message to children younger than 8: "This is all very complicated, but our job is to keep you safe. And that's what we are going to do as adults." (WP02)		
Calls to action	Code this for any references to calls to action.	• May include calls to action for white or black people, or to people generally.	• Does NOT include advice, unless the advice includes an imperative statement.	• May be general – LeBron James at the ESPY awards: "It's time we look in the mirror and ask ourselves, 'What are we doing to create change?'" (BB024) • "We can, and must, do better." (ES-108) • May be specific: "There are lots of things you can do after the killing of #AltonSterling and #PhilandoCastile. Here is one:		

				joincampaignzero.org" (AI02-10, Brittany Packnett)		
Expressions of negative emotion	Code this for references to negative-valenced emotions in response to Castile's death or to police-involved shootings generally.	• Includes sadness, anger, frustration, fatigue, shock, grief	• Does NOT include expressions of fear of police.	• "In the moments just after tragedy, words can seem insufficient in expressing the shock, anger, and despair a person might feel." (article text, HP056) • "The tears splashed down my cheeks as I watched the video of Castile's girlfriend." (article text, HP058) • Description of vigils for black victims: "The anger in the space was as palatable as the sorrow; twin emotions mirroring the fatality fatigue that builds up over time." (article text,	• Use of emojis (e.g., crying emoji) in tweet or article. • Descriptions of crying ("As a black man, I have cried more times than I care to admit in the past week, particularly after hearing the audiotape of Diamond Reynolds' live Facebook video following the killing of her fiance, Philando Castile, in Falcon Heights, Minn." Article text, TR20)	

				HP076) • "My mom was screaming and wailing," Allysza said. She lay beside her mother in bed, cradling her as she fell asleep in tears. "I held her like a baby. I held her like she was my baby." (WP01) • Kamala Harris, CA attorney general: article described an "emotional speech…in which she lost her composure." Includes this quote from Harris: "I believe we are at a moment in this country where people are experiencing an incredible amount of pain." (BB007) • Basketball player LeBron James described the feelings of himself	• Psychological effects of watching news on police brutality (HP023)	

				and other NBA players during a statement at ESPY awards: "We all feel helpless and frustrated by the violence." (BB024)		
Fear/distrust of police	Code this for references to feeling afraid or distrustful of police.	• This may include personal confession of fear or distrust, or it may refer to a general fear or distrust of police.	• Does NOT include expressions of other emotions such as grief or anger.	• "They (high school students) said students of color didn't trust the officers in their buildings and that police should not get involved in the routine enforcement of classroom behavior standards." (article text, PP85) • Diamond Reynolds: "She said, 'Mom, the police are bad guys.'" (PP75) • Mom describing fear about her black son: Mine are not tears of joy but, rather, tears of fear. Fear for them growing up.	"Hart said she remembers a time, before the neighborhood was gutted, when residents didn't fear police. Officers knew people by name and waved to neighbors, she said, creating a more cohesive community. Now, nearly 60 years later, Hart feels there's a strong separation between police and the communities they serve, particularly those of color." (ST003) "The governor's comments cast judgment on law enforcement and	"I didn't do it for pity, I didn't do it for fame. I did it so that the world knows that these police are not here to protect and serve us. They are here to assassinate us. They are here to kill us. Because we are black." (Diamond Reynolds, TR05)

				Fear of them no longer being viewed as the adorable, innocent, silly children I know them to be, particularly by those in positions of authority. (article text, TR30) • "In an attempt to better relations with community and police officers, the video does the exact opposite. It further highlights the fear that black people carry with them the moment they see flashing lights in their rearview mirror." (TR60)	deepen mistrust between officers and the communities they serve." (ES09-2, St. Paul Police Federation response to Gov. Dayton's statement) "Everyone tends to ask whether police reasonably feared for their lives, never if #KorrynGaines reasonably feared for hers." (Samuel Sinyangwe, AI11-4)	
Social disparities	Code this if unit references social disparities between whites and racial/ethnic minorities.	• May include references to economic, educational, or criminal justice disparities, including police shootings.	• This does NOT include references to cultural differences.	• Obama: "When incidents like this occur, there's a big chunk of our citizenry that feels as if, because of the color of their skin, they are not		

				being treated the same" (NYT01) • In response to Trump's convention speech accepting RNC nom: "Yeah. He meant law and order for whites, martial law for everyone else #FreedomNow #TrumpThat" (Alicia Garza, in response to another Twitter user – AI01-7)		
systemic racism	Code this if unit uses variation of the word "systemic" to refer to racism or racial disparities.	• MUST include word "systemic," "institutional," "societal," or "structural" • May reference systemic racism or call racism a systemic problem.	• NOT references to other systemic problems (like violence).	• "We're so afraid of being labeled racist that we refuse to see the systemic disparities right in front of our face." (article text, HP071) • Clinton: "She vowed to fight "systemic racism" in police departments and to better train law enforcement officials and	"It was at this crowded intersection of race, societal order and emasculation that (Micah X.) Johnson, like (Robert) Charles, picked up his gun. Both men were exorcising pent-up frustration with historical and systemic injustice with horrific consequence for	"Many activists, columnists and pundits reject or criticize the 'bad apple' narrative as a simplistic evasion of the deep, systemic problems in American policing." (TR50) – refers to policing, which may include racial disparities but is not exclusively referring to race issues

				integrate them into the communities they serve." (NYT20 – also coded for "police training")	those nearby." (WP20) May be used in sneer quotes: "The idea of 'systemic racism,' which has become a Hillary Clinton talking point, is an absurd contrivance that presumes all white people to be guilty, and is used to bully people — including liberals — into conformity with the radical left." (BB080)	
"epidemic"	Code this if unit uses the word "epidemic" to describe race-related police violence or racism generally.	• MUST use the word "epidemic" (in noun or adjective form). • MUST be referring to violence or racism.	• NOT references to other "epidemics" such as medical epidemics.	"On Thursday's broadcast of 'SportsNation' on ESPN2, co-host and former NFL player Marcellus Wiley reacted to the recent fatal shootings of Alton Sterling and Philando Castile at the hands of law enforcement, saying similar shootings have 'become		

				epidemic.'" (BB005) "These words rang hollow in light of the epidemic of police shootings of black women and men over the past three years." (TR40) "Fixing this epidemic feels like such an insidious behemoth, but we can't keep going like this." (HP058)		
"implicit bias"	Code this if unit uses phrase "implicit bias" or some iteration of phrase.	• May include references to "implicit bias" or "implicit racism" or "unconscious bias" or "unconscious racism."	• Does NOT include other uses of the word "implicit." • Do NOT include any examples that do not include either the word "implicit" or "unconscious."	"She (Clinton) wants training in "implicit bias" across police forces." (BB046) "Heralding what New York City was doing to prevent similar annihilations of both human life and public trust from occurring, he (Mayor Bill de Blasio) mentioned programs to train and regularly	"'How many times have we seen a white person with knives, with guns, and they point it at police and they walk away (alive)?' said Minneapolis NAACP President Nekima Levy-Pounds, addressing the Summit Avenue protesters on Friday." (PP30) – implies implicit bias "The implicit-bias	

				retrain officers in the techniques of de-escalating violence and, more pointedly, the work that officers would soon begin doing to help them understand "implicit bias." (NYT45) "A growing number of municipal leaders, academics and community advocates across the country maintain that even without consciously meaning to, law enforcement officials often exhibit "implicit bias" — or unknowing prejudice — when dealing with people of color." (PP30)	curriculum is a fad right now in law enforcement circles and in certain segments of the corporate world seeking to become more sensitive to issues of diversity and difference." (NYT045)	

"privilege"	Code this if unit references racial (white) privilege.	• May use term "white privilege" or simply "privilege" or "privileged" to discuss differences in experiences.	• Do NOT code for reference to social or economic disparities, unless the word "privilege" is invoked.	• "While other children have the privilege to be carefree, our children, particularly our boys, have the additional burden of not appearing too threatening—all of this long before they can even drive." (TR30)		"As demonstrated by the Stanford prison experiment, being placed in a position of authority is a huge privilege, but also a huge responsibility." (DC07) – does not refer to racial privilege
Second Amendment and minorities	Code this if unit questions whether minorities have same Second Amendment rights as white people.	• This refers to disparities in the Second Amendment rights of white people and minorities – misapplication of rights, violation of rights, different treatment of white people and minorities who possess legal weapons.	• Do NOT code for other disparities. • Do NOT code for violation of other rights (i.e., First Amendment). • Do NOT code for simple reference to Second Amendment rights without reference to minorities.	• Quoted tweet: "The fact that the NRA won't defend LICENSED gun carriers like #PhilandoCastile PROVES that "right to bear arms is only a WHITE PRIVILEGE" (HP065) • "Your move, @NRA. #PhilandoCastile [POSTED WITH RETWEETED MESSAGE:] Police sources: Philando Castile -	Implied: "Dear @NRA, Since 'All Lives Matter,' I await your statement supporting legal gun owner and police shooting victim #PhilandoCastile. Today." (AI02-12, Brittany Packnett)	

				man shot by police officer - did indeed have a concealed carry permit with @Hennepin @kare11" (Johnetta Elzie, AI05; also code for "open carry") • "Hey @NRA were are you now on fighting 4 justice 4 #PhilandoCastile he was a person exercising his 2nd amendment right o I forgot he is black" (AI10-16, Dominque Alexander)		
Racial divisions	Code this if unit references racial divisions in the United States.	• This may be any reference, implicit or explicit, to a division, misunderstanding, or disunity across racial lines. • Context of the reference must be race, but	• Other social divisions (socioeconomic, gender, etc.) should not be coded.	• "There's been a sense that America is a country divided." (HP046) • "The United States has never been United! We put on this amazing image around the world of who we are, but	"Man. This whole story about BLM setting race relations backwards. What exactly do y'all think has been happening since the 1700s?!" (Alicia Garza – AI01-6)	

		reference to division does not need to explicitly mention race.		as a country we don't live up to it" (AI04-2, Jaymal Green)		
"white supremacy"	Code this if unit references "white supremacy."	• Must use exact term "white supremacy."	• Any reference to supremacy other than "white supremacy" should be excluded.	• The system of white supremacy has its foot on the necks of every black person in America. How do we move beyond making moral appeals that seemingly fall on deaf ears?" (HP077) • "It is the height of white supremacy for one to tell an oppressed people that they must not only survive injustice but must also fix an evil system that they did not design." (TR27)		

Calls for unity	Code this if unit includes call for racial unity or unity within the United States.	• Includes calls for unity on policy, social unity, or unity to address the issue. • Unity must be across racial, political, or other dividing lines.	• Does NOT include calls for unity of certain groups (unity among police officers, unity among activists)	• Obama: "This is not just a black issue, not just a Hispanic issue. This is an American issue that we should all care about." (NYT01) • Carmelo Anthony: "While I don't have a solution, and I'm pretty sure a lot of people don't have a solution, we need to come together more than anything at this time." (NYT025) • Calls for racial reconciliation (TR40) • Trying to emphasize that need for unity, Obama flew to Dallas with Sen. Ted Cruz (R-Tex.) on Air Force One. (WP15) • "I urge all of us, everywhere, to call upon our own		

				better natures: to care for one another, seek to understand one another, and together build stronger, safer communities for everyone." (ES05-2, statement from Mark Dayton) • "Now more than ever, law enforcement needs the support of the community and the community needs law enforcement. We need to come together in unity - the future starts by building relationships and increasing trust." (ES08 – Police Officers' Federation of Minneapolis) • "This is not a time to play the blame game it is the time to stand together." (AI10-14,		

				Dominique Alexander)		
Call for black nation	Code this if unit references calls for a black nation within or outside the United States.	• Call may come from white people or minorities. • May also refer to "black nationalism" generally	• Do NOT code for white nationalism. • Do NOT code for simple mention of racial divisions.	• Huey P. Newton Gun Club: "We want freedom. We want the power to practice self-determination, and to determine the destiny of our community and THE BLACK NATION." (BB122) • Some black radicals are calling for the creation of a racially segregated black nation in five American states after the deaths of Philando Castile and Alton Sterling — both black men — at the hands of U.S. police officers. (DC28)	Micah Xavier Johnson, who killed five police officers in Dallas, was increasingly drawn to black nationalist ideology and attended several meetings of the People's New Black Panther Party. (WP38) The number of black separatist groups nearly doubled in 2015, mirroring a similar increase among white hate groups that has taken place as police killings make frequent headlines, said Ryan Lenz, online editor and senior writer at the Southern Poverty Law Center.	

					(BB090)	
Police aggression	Code this if unit refers to excess police aggression against protesters or others.	• Includes references to excessive use of force or tactics in dealing with protesters	• Does NOT include descriptions of police shootings (should be coded as description of case or reference to other incident). • Does NOT include rights infringement or references to general injustice.	"We told y'all @sppdPIO maced children #govmansion #PhilandoCastile" (IS001)		
Infringement of rights	Code this if unit asserts that First Amendment/freedom of speech or assembly rights were infringed upon.	• May refer to infringement of First Amendment or freedom of speech or assembly rights. • Can be in the context of protests, Twitter use, or other forms of speech,	• NOT references to infringements on other rights (i.e., 2nd Amendment)	• "of course they wouldn't, smh @sppdPIO walked all over your first amendment right to peacefully assemble, what a sham" (AO01-18, @BlackLivesMpls) • "You can't jail us all, the world is		

		and may come from any side (BLM or police supporters).		watching you perform these injustices #PhilandoCastile #GovMansion" (AO01-21)		
Threats against police	Code this if unit references threats of violence against police officers.	• This includes any threat of violence against police in general or an officer in specific, including Yanez or officers involved in the deaths of other minorities.	• Does NOT include references to actual violence against police (for example, during protests or the Dallas shooting)	"Shortly after Castile's shooting, St. Paul Police Chief Todd Axtell said that, while there has been no specific threat against his department, people have left comments on the department's Facebook page, such as, "What happened in Dallas should have happened in your city."" (PP05) In Wisconsin, a man posted calls on social media for black men to gun down white officers, and a woman in Illinois		St. Paul police headquarters has been on lockdown since Thursday night as a precaution amid protests. (PP70) – no specific mention of threats

				threatened in an online video to shoot and kill any officer who pulled her over, police said. (BB090)		
Violence against police	Code this for descriptions of violence committed against police.	• Violence may be committed by protesters or others	• Does NOT include threats of violence (code that for "threats against police").	• Discussion of Dallas police shooting • Violence during protests • "We were just informed that the officer who had a concrete block dropped on his head during I-94 riot has broken vertebrae." (IS003) • "An officer was just hit in the face with bottle thrown by a protester on St. Paul street. #I94closed" (St. Paul Police PIO twitter, ES11-10)		

Rejection of Black Lives Matter	Code this if unit includes rejection of Black Lives Matter movement, BLM activists, or the goals of BLM.	• This may include threats against BLM or protesters, or may simply reject the message of BLM. • May also include expressions of frustration at protests.	• Does NOT include expressions of support for police that do not mention BLM or protesters (for example, #backtheblue) • Does NOT include implicit rejection (for example, #alllivesmatter).	• A detective in Michigan was demoted, meanwhile, for lashing out at Black Lives Matter protesters on Facebook, while authorities in Kansas said they fired an officer there who posted a threatening Facebook comment. (WP15)		
"Black militant" or "black militancy"	Code this if unit refers to "black militant(s)" or "black militancy"	• MUST include some form of the word "militant"	• Does NOT include reference to black nationalism.	• "But it is also commonly associated with the 1960s black power salute which emerged from militant offshoots of the U.S. civil rights groups such as the Black Panther Party." (BB055)		

Black Lives Matter terrorism	Code this if unit includes statement that associates BLM with terrorism.	• May draw connection between BLM and terrorism • May call BLM a terrorist organization, or refer to the group's tactics as a form of terrorism	• Does NOT include descriptions of violence by protesters, if no connection is made to terrorism.	• "A petition to officially designate Black Lives Matter as a terrorist organization has gathered over 90,000 signatures on the White House website." (BB089)	• Any article/tweet that attempts to draw a connection between Micah Johnson (Dallas shooter) and BLM activists may be coded as this.	
Media criticism	Code this if unit offers criticism of the media generally or specific media.	• This includes any article, tweet, or statement that offers specific or general criticism of the news media in their reporting on Castile's case, police-involved shootings, or racial disparities.	• Does NOT include criticism of individuals quoted in the media (for example, criticism of what someone said in an interview)	• "The New York Post front page for Friday features a photo of the slain cops with a headline that reads, in large, bold letters: **CIVIL WAR**. The words might as well be "RACE WAR." It's a dangerous implication" (HP064) • "Over the past year false narratives of officer involved incidents forwarded by agenda driven organizations and		

				perpetuated by the media have driven our communities apart." (ES08 – Police Officers' Federation of Minneapolis) • "I flew across the country for #PotusTownhall and was silenced by @ABC" (Patrisse Cullors, AI08-14)		
Support for Black Lives Matter	Code this if unit includes expressions of support for BLM protesters or goals.	• Includes expressions of support for Black Lives Matter and/or its goals. • Also includes expressions of support for protesters and their goals.	• Does not include expressions of sympathy for Castile's family or of other emotions, unless BLM is invoked.	• Lynx players wearing BLM t-shirts before game. • Asian-American woman encourages other Asian Americans to support BLM (TR35) • Thank you @minnesotalynx for standing up in the name of justice. #MinnesotaLynx #BlackLivesMatter (IS002)	"someone started shooting off fireworks for us [happy face emoji] #i94shtudown #PhilandoCastile #AltonSterling" (AI06-5 – Mica Grimm tweet)	

Request for aid	Code this if unit refers to or directly requests aid for protesters.	• May include requests for food, water, extra protesters, bail money, medical aid, etc.	• Does NOT include requests for help outside the scope of protests (for example, legislative help).	• water and hot food I'm sure would be appreciated, thank you!! (IS001) • We still need folks at the #govmansion (IS001) • WE NEED PEOPLE AT THE #GovMansion RIGHT NOW!!! Someone please start live streaming ASAP (IS001) • WE NEED MALOX AND SPRAY BOTTLES TO HELP PROTESTERS MACED AT THE #GOVMANSION #PhilandoCastile (IS001) • There will also be ongoing legal costs associated with ppls defense, please donate thru paypal to blacklivesmatterm pls2016@gmail.co		

				m (IS001) • Bail support for 130 arrested last night in St. Paul! #freetheprotestors #PhilandoCastile (AI02-7, Brittany Packnett) • "It is critical as many people stay at the protest as possible, if you have a couple of hours please come down to the #GovMansion" (AI01-1, BLM Mpls)		
Support for police	Code this if unit includes expressions of support for police or police officers.	• Includes expressions of support following Dallas shooting. • Also includes expressions of support for police in general, including use of hashtags such as #backtheblue and #bluelivesmatter.	• Does NOT include any reference to police policy.	• Troy Aikman tweeted after Dallas: "Sadly most police departments around the country don't feel much support these days. #backtheblue" (HP055)		

Celebrity quoted	Code this if a news article quotes or references the words of a celebrity discussing Castile or race- or police-related issues.	• This includes athletes, celebrities, and other famous entertainers • Can include quotes gathered in person or from Twitter/other platform	• Does NOT include politicians – code for official/elite	• Quotes of celebrities or athletes (Carmelo Anthony)		
Official/elite quoted	Code this if a news article quotes or references the words of an official or elite source discussing Castile or race- or police-related issues.	• May include current or former politicians or representatives of organizations (including nonprofits or advocacy organizations) • Can include quotes gathered in person or from Twitter/other platform •	• Does NOT include celebrities or athletes	•		
Tweets quoted/referenced	Code this if specific tweet is quoted or referenced in a news article.	• This includes any Tweets that are in quotes or screenshots included in an article.	• This does NOT include tweets included in the tweet sample.	•		

BLM quoted	Code this if a news article quotes or references the words of a BLM activist or supporter.	• Can include quotes gathered in person or from Twitter	• Does NOT include non-profits or political leaders who have similar goals as BLM (e.g., NAACP – code for official/elite quoted).	•		

APPENDIX B: SECOND-CYCLE CODEBOOK (COLLAPSED CODES)

Category 1: CASE-SPECIFIC DESCRIPTIONS
Definition: Units in this category detail the case and context of the death of Philando Castile and the protests that followed it.

Subcategory: Description of events
Definition: Units coded in this subcategory describe the events and details of Philando Castile's death and the subsequent protests. It includes descriptions of cooperation between police and protesters, as well as the *in vivo* code "murder" to describe Castile's killing.

Codes included:
- Code: Description of case & description of protests
- Code: Cooperation between protesters & police
- Code: "murder" or "murdered"

Subcategory: Humanizing actors
Definition: Units coded in this subcategory include characterizations of Castile and Officer Jeronimo Yanez that serve to humanize them.

Codes included:
- Code: Humanizing victim
- Code: Humanizing perpetrator

Subcategory: References to other cases
Definition: Units coded in this subcategory made comparisons to other cases of police-involved violence, gun violence, or police actions.

Codes included:
- Code: References to other deaths (Reference to death of Alton Sterling + Reference to Dallas shootings + Reference to others + Reference to gun violence)
- Code: Comparison to white cases

Category 2: POLICING ISSUES
Definition: Units coded in this category define problems with and solutions to the current state of policing in the United States or specific jurisdictions.

Subcategory: Challenges to policing
Definition: Units coded in this subcategory referred to certain legal, social, or political challenges that interfere with effective or fair policing.

Codes included:
- Code: Gun control

- Code: Police revenue
- Code: Racial profiling
- Code: Open-carry

Subcategory: Police reforms
Definition: Units coded in this subcategory referred to proposals for improving policing to make it more effective and fair.

Codes included:
- Code: Body cameras
- Code: Community policing
- Code: Police accountability
- Code: Diversifying police
- Code: Police training
- Code: Police reform (other) + privatizing police

Category 3: ADVICE
Units coded in this category offer advice or calls to action to address the issue of police brutality.

Subcategory: Advice for groups
Definition: Units coded in this subcategory offered advice to a group or groups of people on matters of police-related violence or racial inequity.

Codes included:
- Code: Advice for black people
- Code: Advice for white people
- Code: Advice for parents/educators

Subcategory: Calls to action
Definition: Units coded in this subcategory include a call to action to audiences.

Codes included:
- Code: Calls to action

Category 4: EXPRESSIONS OF EMOTIONS
Units coded in this category include expressions of fear, anger, and other negative emotions following the death of Philando Castile.

Subcategory: Expressions of negative emotion
Definition: Units coded in this subcategory referred to negative emotions that were expressed in response to Castile's death or police-involved shootings more generally.

Codes included:

- Code: Expressions of negative emotion

Subcategory: Fear/distrust of police
Definition: Units coded in this subcategory referred to expressions of fear or distrust of police.

Codes included:
- Code: Fear/distrust of police

Category 5: SOCIAL CRITIQUES
Units coded in this category offer observations on or proposals to reform the current state of race relations in the United States.

Subcategory: Racism & race-related issues
Definition: Units coded in this subcategory discussed the larger role of race or race-related issues in society.

Codes included:
- Code: Social disparities (social disparities + "systemic racism" + "epidemic" + "implicit bias" + "privilege"
- Code: Second Amendment and minorities
- Code: Racial divisions (racial divisions + "white supremacy")

Subcategory: Calls for change
Definition: Units coded in this subcategory called for social changes to address the matter of police-involved killings of black people.

Codes included:
- Code: Calls for unity
- Code: Call for black nation

Category 6: DISAPPROVAL
Units coded in this category suggested disapproval of police, the Black Lives Matter movement, or the media in its coverage of Philando Castile's death or related cases.

Subcategory: Criticism of Black Lives Matter
Definition: Units coded in this subcategory include criticisms of the goals or methods of Black Lives Matter activists or the Black Lives Matter movement.

Codes included:
- Code: Rejection of Black Lives Matter
- Code: Black militancy ("Black militant" or "black militancy" + Black Lives Matter terrorism)

Subcategory: Criticism of Police
Definition: Units coded in this subcategory include criticisms of police, including criticisms of their methods and threats or violence directed at police in protest of those methods.

Codes included:

- Code: Police overreach (Police aggression + Infringement of rights)
- Code: Aggression toward police (Threats against police + violence against police)

Subcategory: Criticism of the Media
Definition: Units coded in this subcategory include criticisms of the media generally or of specific media outlets.

Codes included:

- Code: Media criticism

Category 7: EXPRESSIONS OF SUPPORT
Units coded in this category offered expressions of or request for support for police or the Black Lives Matter movement.

Subcategory: Support for Black Lives Matter
Definition: Units coded in this subcategory include expressions of support and requests for material aid for the Black Lives Matter movement.

Codes included:

- Code: Request for aid
- Code: Support for Black Lives Matter

Subcategory: Support for Police
Definition: Units coded in this subcategory included expressions of support for police or police officers.

Codes included:

- Code: Support for police

APPENDIX C: FRAMING CODEBOOK
(adapted from Kiousis et al., 2009)

Frame of each issue presented (choose one):
Each article, press statement, or tweet should be coded for its dominant frame. The dominant frame is determined by answering the question: *Which frame is the most dominant in this unit?* The dominant frame in articles and press statements should be determined by looking at the headline and first three paragraphs. To determine the dominant frame of tweets, coders should consider the entire message. Frame definitions are as follows:

- Conflict frame: a frame that underlines the conflicting nature of the issue by emphasizing the polarization between two individuals, groups, institutions or ideologies. (Kiousis et al., 2009)
    - Example: Description of tensions between police and protesters
    - Example: Description of political disputes IF dispute is contentious (if not, code as "problem and issue definition")
    - Non-example: Tweet or article that lays blame for problem on another person, people, institution (should be coded as "attribution of responsibility")
- Cooperation (harmony): a frame that emphasizes the cooperation between two people, groups, or institutions (Supadhiloke, 2012)
    - Example: Article or tweet that describes cooperation between police and protesters, between politician(s) and Black Lives Matter, etc.
    - Example: Expressions of support for Black Lives Matter or police
    - Non-example: A description of a person or expression of emotions should be coded as "human interest frame"
- Problem and issue definition: a frame that contains a deliberate description about the issue (Kiousis & Kim, 2012)
    - This includes all articles, tweets, or press releases that simply describe Castile's case or the protests that follow.
    - Also includes any in-depth analysis of a policy, proposal, or problem
    - Example: Description of Castile's shooting or the video Diamond Reynolds streamed on Facebook
- Attribution of responsibility: a frame that emphasizes the attribution of responsibility for the problem to a person, institution or government (Kiousis et al., 2009)
    - This includes any blame for protesters, police, or victims.
    - Example: Attributing responsibility to Castile for his own death
    - Example: Blaming political system, institutional racism, or police policy for police brutality cases
- Human interest frame: a frame that brings the 'human face' to stories by focusing on people who are or will be affected by this issue. (Kiousis et al., 2009)
    - This includes descriptions of Castile's character or personal life, or descriptions of the impact of his death on friends and family

    - This also includes descriptions of how cases of police brutality impacts minorities. For example, a personal essay by a mother who fears for her black sons should be coded as this.
- Morality frame: a frame that emphasizes the moral and religious aspect of the issue/event/problem (Semetko & Valkenburg, 2000)
    - This frame often includes articles, tweets, or political statements about how society or police *should* be or the norms with which police departments *should* operate.
    - This also includes moral judgments of other people ("he was a bad person," "he deserves what's coming to him," etc.).

APPENDIX D: TIMELINE OF EVENTS
(Compiled from news articles and tweets included in this study's analysis)

July 5, 2016:

- Alton Sterling is shot and killed by police officers in Baton Rouge, Louisiana.

July 6, 2016:

- Philando Castile is pulled over and killed by a police officer in Falcon Heights, Minnesota.

July 7, 2016:

- In the early morning hours of July 7, protesters begin to gather at the site of Castile's shooting to pay tribute and document the scene.
- As word spread, protesters also gathered at the governor's mansion in St. Paul, chanting Castile's name.
- Governor Mark Dayton emerged from the governor's mansion and made a statement about Castile's death.
- The Bureau of Criminal Apprehension identifies Jeronimo Yanez as the officer who fired on Castile.
- In the evening, protests were held in several other major cities around the country, including New York and Chicago, to protest the deaths of Castile and Sterling.
- At the end of a Black Lives Matter protest in Dallas, TX, a lone gunman opens fire and kills 5 police officers and injures 11 other people before killing himself. He reportedly was acting in retaliation for the police shootings of black men.

July 9-10, 2016:

- Protesters begin the evening with peaceful demonstrations in St. Paul, Minnesota, and then shut down nearby Interstate 94. Agitators threw objects at police and officers sprayed the protesters with pepper spray and tear gas in an attempt to disperse the crowd. A total of 21 officers were injured and 102 protesters were arrested.
- Public officials, including President Barack Obama, Minnesota Governor Mark Dayton, and Saint Paul Mayor Chris Coleman called for peaceful protests.

July 14, 2016:

- Castile's funeral at the Cathedral of Saint Paul is attended by thousands of mourners.

July 18, 2016:

- Demonstrators who had set up an encampment in front of the governor's mansion were directed to move. They did so peacefully.

July 19, 2016:

- A total of 21 protesters, including many local teachers who were attending a conference at the Minneapolis Convention Center, were arrested at a protest after refusing to disperse.

July 24-25, 2016:

- Protesters shut down Summit Avenue in front of the governor's mansion in St. Paul, Minnesota.

July 26-27, 2016:

- St. Paul police arrest nearly 70 people protesting Castile's death outside the governor's mansion.

July 29, 2016:

- Ramsey County Attorney John Choi appointed a special prosecutor to help decide whether to file charges against Yanez.

July 30, 2016:

- Protesters cause the early closure of two liquor stores in St. Anthony, Minnesota. According to a report in the Pioneer Press (July 30), the protesters chanted, "Who shut this down? We shut this down!"

August 1, 2016:

- Korryn Gaines, a 23-year-old black woman, was shot and killed by police during an hours-long standoff in Randallstown, Maryland. Gaines posted updates and videos on Facebook and Instagram, drawing comparisons to other cases involving the use of social media, including Castile's.

August 5, 2016:

- Police arrested six people while breaking up a protest at People's Park in St. Paul, Minnesota.